

## ISF INTERIM EVALUATION REPORT

CCI	2014EE65ISNP001
Pealkiri	Eesti National Programme ISF
Versioon	2017.0
Hõlmatud ajavahemik	1.1.2014–30.6.2017

The interim evaluation of the Estonian National Programme ISF was conducted by the independent experts of Civitta Eesti AS. The evaluation followed the Guidance on the common monitoring and evaluation framework of the Asylum, Migration and Integration Fund (AMIF) and the Internal Security Fund (ISF) (Guidance) prepared by DG Migration and Home Affairs in collaboration with Joint Research Centre. The report follows the format of the template of the evaluation report to be submitted via SFC (Chapter 6.5 of the Annex of the Guidance).

The preparation of the Estonian national programme for ISF for the period 2014-2020 was based on the principle that the measures and objectives of the programme must correspond to the goals of the Internal Security Fund (ISF, hereinafter the Fund) and needs at national level, and result in the increase of the state's capability in the policy fields of *visas, surveillance and control of the external border, combating crime and crisis management*. Due to the limited amount of the financial resources of the Fund, only the highest priorities were selected for financing. According to the results of the mid-term review, the overall situation in the policy areas covered by the Fund has not significantly changed as compared to when the national programme for ISF was adopted. At the time of the interim evaluation, the content of the actions and objectives of the programme continue to be **relevant** and address the actual needs identified at national level. Although recent developments in the world demonstrate that new topics (e.g. terrorism, hybrid war) are emerging that have to be addressed even more carefully, they mostly fall into the scope of the programme.

The **effectiveness** of the national programme can be evaluated positively. Although the share of projects which have been completed to date is small, several substantial results have already emerged which have contributed to the achievement of objectives relevant both at national and Union level. The development and implementation of the common **visa policy** has been supported by the creation of an information system for coordinating visa applications, renewing equipment (computers, fingerprint scanners) in consulates and by carrying out trainings for consular, police and border guard officials. The trainings have been highly appreciated by the participants not only in terms of new knowledge and practical skills acquired but also as a source of higher motivation and improved cooperation between colleagues executing similar tasks in different authorities and countries. Therefore, the programme has facilitated substantially for officials to execute their tasks at consulates and at other relevant authorities in accordance with the common visa policy.

In the field of **borders**, the contribution of the actions of the Estonian national ISF programme to the implementation of integrated border management has been to date rather noticeable. As a result of the trainings conducted with the support of the Fund, the potential for the effectiveness of implementing border management-related measures and capability of border guarding have substantially improved. The skills and knowledge gained are used on a daily basis by the border guard and customs officials. The Fund has also contributed to a uniform and high level of control and protection of the external borders. A large part of attention has been turned on improving the communication aspect in securing the external border. In order to improve the surveillance capability in the areas with difficult access, multirotors have been acquired, which help to resolve potential border incidents (incl. illegal border crossings).

The progress made within the national ISF programme in strengthening Estonia's capacity to combat different forms of **crime** can be considered rather significant. Several projects have produced results which have already been put into practice. The majority of the positive impact derives from actions which have focused on renewing the equipment and developing IT solutions relevant for a more effective performance of law enforcement authorities (e.g. introduction of new mobile workstations in the police cars). The programme has also supported the progress in the field of combating illicit drug trafficking in Estonia.

In the field of **risks and crisis**, various actions have already contributed to the assessment, prevention, preparedness and consequence management of security-related risks and crisis.

Reinforcing of the capacity to protect critical infrastructure and people in Estonia has primarily been supported through the acquisition of different equipment and tools (e.g. small bomb robots and heavy bomb suits) and development of information systems. A great deal of attention has been turned on increasing a general capacity of CBRN. The programme has also contributed to the enhancement of information systems to support effective and coordinated response to crisis, and preparation of risk and threat assessments. By the time of the interim evaluation, the capabilities to collect, analyse, handle and store risk and crises related information has already improved.

The use of resources for achieving the objectives set in the programme can be considered fairly **efficient**. Adherence to the budgetary targets has been one of the goals on project level which in general has been reached as the implementation of the projects has largely followed the planned budgets. However, in numerous cases the planning of the project budgets has proved to be rather challenging as the time interval between the planning and the actual implementation of the projects is long. Although the majority of the projects implemented within the programme have managed to follow the initial time plan, in few cases, an extension of the contracted deadlines has been requested in order to achieve the set goals. One of the main reasons that inducing changes in the timetables is connected to the drawbacks faced within the procurement procedures. On programme level, the implementation rate (paid EU contribution compared to the programmed EU contribution) of the actions has been very positive – 69% of the planned funds have already been used by the time of the interim evaluation.

In majority the actions supported with the Fund are rather specific and therefore not eligible for financing from other programmes funded by EU. The strongest level of **coherence** can be noticed and expected between the ISF and European Structural and Investments Fund (ESIF) projects focusing on IT developments. In order to recognise opportunities for synergy and to avoid potential overlap with ESIF measures the planning of the ESIF was followed already during the ISF programming phase. Coherence on programme level has mainly been supported by encouraging cooperation between different projects which has already resulted in making certain changes in the projects to increase the potential impact on programme action level. Regarding the **complementarity**, the objectives and corresponding actions set in the national programme complement the priorities determined in different national strategies related to the area of security (e.g. Development Plan of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Development Plan for the Governing Area of the Ministry of the Interior, Internal Security Strategy for 2015-2020).

At the moment of the interim evaluation, it can be rather firmly stated that the actions of the national programme would not have been implemented at this scale and timeframe without the support of the Fund – hence, the **added value** of the Fund has been remarkable. Although the activities financed in the framework of the programme support the provision of crucial services and some of the actions are directly related to fulfilling EU requirements, the contribution of the state budget as a sole financing source in the supported fields would have likely been smaller and the achievement of the objectives set in the programme and at national level would take longer. The main value of the Fund tends to lie in the fact that it has added volume to existing actions in relevant policy areas and influenced the capacity of the organisations involved in the programmes.

The potential of the **sustainability** of the programme can be assessed rather favourably. The risk that the equipment acquired with support of the Fund will be discarded due to the lack of resources for their maintenance is fairly low – the fulfilment of security related tasks have to be ensured at least a minimum level. Therefore, it is a national priority to find the required

financial resources to ensure that the effects achieved to date will continue after the end of the funding period. However, on the basis of past experience with foreign assistance this has not always been an easy assignment. In recent years, this issue has emerged specifically with regard to the developed IT solutions – further development of the IT systems developed with support of the ISF might not be possible if no additional financial resources will be provided at state level.

What regards the aspect of the **simplification and reduction of administrative burden** of the programme, it can be said that the establishment of the ISF structure has not led to an extensive reduction in the administrative burden compared to the SOLID Fund. Still, the ISF involves a number of advantages (e.g. switching from an annual to a multi-annual structure of the national programme, higher degree of flexibility in planning the programme actions and their budgets), which have to a certain extent simplified programme implementation both from the Member State and beneficiary perspective. Although the eligibility rules have to a large extent remained the same, certain amendments (e.g. making fringe-benefit tax eligible) have proved to be beneficial for beneficiaries. On the downside, the rules complicate reimbursement of labour costs in case of there is an overlap between the project-related tasks and regular duties of the project personnel.

## SECTION I: CONTEXT OF IMPLEMENTATION OF ISF DURING 1.1.2014–30.6.2017

Estonia ensures the guarding and protection of over 1,100 km of external borders of the Schengen Area and over 300 km of European Union's external border. The external border is guarded on land and in sea areas by patrols and with surveillance systems based on cordons. Prior to the ISF, the development of border management has among others been financed within the External Borders Fund (EBF), the European Neighbourhood and Partnership Instrument, the SF and the Phare programme. In 2014, with regard to the incident at the Estonian-Russian border, a need to secure the border rose even more to the spotlight.

Regarding visa policy, as the number of visa applicants has been growing by 15-20% a year, there is a constant need for a more professional approach towards visa proceedings, including cooperation between authorities. Therefore, regular trainings of consular officers are required in order to execute tasks in line with the Schengen acquis. Additionally, trainings to promote efficient inter-agency cooperation are expected. The administrative costs related to issuing visas are financed from the state budget.

In the field of crime, combating illicit trade in narcotics has been a long-time priority. However, before the ISF, no financial support has been applied from EU or other funds in the area of narcotics-related crime. Additionally, as crime is increasingly moving to Internet, the number of data media containing digital evidence has remarkably grown in recent years. But existing national resources cannot ensure sufficient capability for the analysis and management of digital evidence, which in turn has a negative impact on solving crimes.

Prior to the ISF, a large part of the equipment used in the field of demining and CBRN has been received as an aid from the United States. It has not been possible to cover large investments from the national budget to keep up with technological developments (e.g. in terms of personal protection equipment) in the fields of CBRN and explosive ordnance disposal. The need for the further progress in these areas has become even more important with regard to the Estonia's Presidency on the second half of 2017.

## II JAGU. TEKKINUD RASKUSED JA NENDE MÕJU RIIKLIKU PROGRAMMI RAKENDAMISELE

During the implementation of the national programme for ISF, no major challenges have been encountered that would have severely impacted the performance of the programme. Although there are projects which have faced certain obstacles (e.g. delays due to failed procurements, unexpected increase in prices) within their implementation, they have not yet jeopardized the overall achievement of the planned results. The challenges have mainly resulted in the delay of project activities.

One of the external factors which has somewhat challenged the implementation of certain projects in terms of their budget is connected to the prices of equipment (e.g. vehicles) purchased within the programme – in several cases the actual cost of equipment has exceeded the planned costs. As a result, it has not always been possible to acquire the desired amount of devices. In few cases, it has even been necessary to abandon the purchase of certain equipment (e.g. bomb containers, vehicles for watercraft transportation).

A certain bottleneck inherent to the IT sector has been the deficiency of offers within the procurement procedures. This challenge has only emerged lately, but if it persists to continue, it might affect the implementation of projects connected to the development of different IT solutions in the future.

Another aspect that has slightly influenced the programme implementation is related to the circumstance that the Estonian Presidency started half a year earlier than initially foreseen, causing delays in some projects.

### III JAGU. RIIKLIKU PROGRAMMI RAKENDAMISES ILMNENUD KÕRVALEKALDED VÕRRELDES ALGSELT KAVANDATUGA (KUI ON)

As the description of potential actions under the national objectives is sufficiently general in the Estonian national programme, there have been no major deviations in implementing the programme in comparison with what was initially planned. It can be said that the projects have been implemented mostly in accordance with what is anticipated in the programme. Also, there has been no need to make further changes to the objectives of the programme and currently no factors have been identified that might lead to changes in the future.

An example of a deviation is ending a grant agreement for a project ISFP-15 "Prevention of terrorism via enhancing cooperation on visa consultation", which was cancelled before any activities or costs could occur. The project aimed at prevention of terrorism in relation to migration crisis and the Estonian Presidency. Since the migration crises did not affect Estonia at a significant level and the Presidency started half a year earlier than initially planned, the need for the project was minimal and therefore it was decided to use the project allocation for Arabic language courses.

An unexpected change in the period of Estonian Presidency has affected also other projects resulting in the changes of their implementation schedule. For instance, in the project related to the widening of the coverage of the operative radio communication network, it was decided not to make changes in the network during the high period of the Presidency. Furthermore, as several people taking part in the ISF projects are also involved in executing tasks connected to the Presidency, there have been conflicts in finding necessary human resources.

#### IV JAGU. HINDAMISKÜSIMUSED

1	Tulemuslikkus
---	---------------

1.1	Erieesmärk 1. Viisapoliitika / ISF-B artikli 3 lõike 2 punkt a
	<p>Üldine küsimus: Kuidas aitas fond kaasa järgmiste erieesmärkide saavutamisele:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- ühise viisapoliitika toetamine seadusliku reisimise lihtsustamiseks;</li> <li>- kvaliteetse teenuse osutamine viisataotlejatele;</li> <li>- kolmandate riikide kodanike võrdse kohtlemise tagamine ja</li> <li>- ebaseadusliku sisserände tõkestamine?</li> </ul>
	<p>All of the actions implemented within the Estonian national ISF programme under the specific objective ‘Support a common visa policy’ have promoted the implementation of the common visa policy.</p> <p>The development and implementation of the common visa policy to facilitate legitimate travel has been primarily supported through the creation of an information system for coordinating visa applications. Although the elaboration of the system is not completely finalised, it has created preconditions for a faster process of visa issuance. Provision of high quality service to visa applicants has also been supported by renewing equipment in consulates. The purchase of computers and fingerprint scanners for the officials working in consulates has already contributed to a more efficient and smoother visa processing. With regard to relevant indicators, then all of the consulates (23 out of 23) have been developed or upgraded with the help of the Fund, which is more than planned (18), also in terms of the percentage (100%, planned 78%).</p> <p>The Fund has also significantly contributed to carrying out trainings (including joint trainings) for consular, police and border guard officials in Estonia to promote the implementation of the common visa policy. The trainings have been highly appreciated by the participants not only in terms of new knowledge and practical skills acquired but also as a source of higher motivation and improved cooperation between colleagues executing similar tasks in different authorities and countries. As the trainings have addressed the issues related to VIS and detection of false documents, the Fund has contributed also to tackling illegal migration and to ensuring equal treatment of third-country nationals. Regarding the indicator related to the number of staff trained in aspects related to the common visa policy with the help of the Fund, its target level has almost been achieved (79%) by the time of the interim evaluation.</p> <p>All in all, the projects implemented in the field of visa policy with the support of the Fund aim at harmonising relevant procedures in Estonia and with other Member States. Therefore, the programme has facilitated substantially for officials to execute their tasks at consulates and at other relevant authorities in accordance with the common visa policy, which is in the interests of all other Member States in the Schengen area.</p>

1.1.1	Millist edu saavutati ühise viisapoliitika arendamise ja rakendamise edendamisel, et lihtsustada seaduslikku reisimist, ja milline osa oli selles fondil?
	<p>The development and implementation of the common visa policy to facilitate legitimate travel has been primarily promoted through the creation of an information system for coordinating visa applications. This has been necessary in order to complete developments related to common Visa Information System of the European Union (VIS) in the visa register.</p> <p>Within the first phase of the creation of the information system a preliminary analysis was carried out by the beneficiary organisation in order to map all the needs that should be met with the information system. The results of the analysis have been used as an input for elaborating the information system. The minimal viable version of the system has already been completed. During the development process the manual testing of the system was replaced with automatic testing, which has proved to be more purposeful and ultimately more efficient. As the elaboration of the information system for coordinating visa applications is not yet completely finished, its actual benefits will come about in the near future. However, it is expected that the system created with the support of the Fund helps to speed up the process of visa issuance and harmonise further the procedure for examining visa applications with procedures used in the consulates of other Member States. That in turn contributes to the facilitation of facilitate legitimate travel by ensuring a service of high quality to visa applicants which is one of the aims of the common visa policy.</p> <p>The implementation of common visa policy has also been promoted by renewing equipment (computers and fingerprint scanners) necessary within the processes related to the proceeding of visa applications. New computers allow a more effective, faster and smoother visa processing and new fingerprint scanners enable to forward high-quality fingerprint files to the central system of VIS. As a result, the quality of the service (processing of visa applications) offered to the public is of a higher standard and follows good administrative practices.</p>

1.1.2	Millist edu saavutati parema konsulaaresinduste võrgu ning viisade väljaandmise ühtlustatud tavade tagamisel liikmesriikide vahel ja milline osa oli selles fondil?
	<p>Harmonised practices on visa issuance between Member States have primarily been supported by carrying out trainings for consular, police and border guard officials and the officials of the Ministry of the Interior. The main goal of the trainings has been to contribute to the correct and harmonised implementation of the EU common visa policy and Schengen acquis. The actions of the national programme have not contributed directly to ensuring better consular coverage.</p> <p>The trainings carried out to date can be considered very successful and have served their purpose. The main topics of the trainings aimed at ensuring</p>

	<p>harmonised practices on visa issuance included capturing of fingerprints of visa applicants, visa information system (VIS), visa register and enhancing consuls' cooperation with other relevant state authorities. Today the VIS is fully operational and the trainings have contributed to the circumstance that transition to capturing fingerprints has been smooth in all of the Estonian representations processing visa applications outside the EU. Moreover, the quality of captured fingerprints has improved as well. In addition, consuls' skills to independently solve VIS-related bottlenecks have improved (the quality of data sent to VIS has enhanced). It should be noted that the feedback by all of the participants to the trainings related to the VIS, capturing fingerprints and visa register was very good – the main added value for the participants was the practical aspect of the training (capturing fingerprints) and the involvement of the officials of the Police and Border Guard Board (PBGB).</p> <p>Regarding the training focusing on the consuls' cooperation with other relevant state authorities (PBGB and Estonian Internal Security Service), then in addition to the general aspects of the cooperation also an overview was given about how the control of aliens entering Estonia with visas issued by consular officials takes place at the external border. This is substantial so that officials involved in the process would understand each other's roles related to the processing and issuance of visas. The aim of the joint training for the authorities (to improve the management of information and communication between the authorities and internally) has been accomplished – participants have a better overview about the particularities of the work of the involved authorities (e.g. which programmes are used) and understand further the background of the decisions made during the visa processes by counterparts.</p> <p>Harmonised practices of visa issuing will be further strengthened with upcoming trainings, which are similar to internships – officials are going to visit several consular representations for the purpose of gathering experience on how similar work is organised and which problems are faced and how these are solved in other offices. This training is highly anticipated by the officials as it involves relevant experience and information exchange and as a result allows making necessary improvements in executing their daily tasks.</p>
--	---

1.1.3	Millist edu saavutati viisaside reguleeriva liidu õigustiku kohaldamise tagamisel ja milline osa oli selles fondil?
	<p>Application of the Union's acquis has primarily been supported by carrying out trainings for consular, police and border guard officials and the officials of the Ministry of the Interior. The main goal of the trainings has been to contribute to the correct and harmonised implementation of the EU common visa policy and Schengen acquis.</p> <p>In addition to the trainings related to VIS, capturing fingerprints and enhancing cooperation between different authorities (discussed under section 1.1.2), a training focusing on the cooperation with external service providers has been conducted with the support of the Fund. As a result of the training, the consuls</p>

	<p>dealing with processing of Schengen visas in Estonian foreign representations are more aware about the possibilities to use the external service providers and cooperation with them has improved (consuls have a better overview of the work processes of external service providers). This supports well one of the principles of the Union's acquis on visas which foresees that Member States shall endeavour to cooperate with an external service provider together with one or more Member States.</p> <p>One of the trainings addressed also issues related to document verifications and security issues (e.g. migration risks of applicants). Trainings, which targeted officials working in representations where a higher share of migration risk among the visa applicants is observed, were conducted in Cairo, Beijing, New Delhi and Ankara. The participants received a thorough overview about false travel documents and visas and gained practical skills to detect such false documents. As a result, the skills and knowledge of the officials working in these representations improved substantially in tackling illegal migration. New knowledge about the false documents was considered particularly useful by the participants for their work.</p> <p>Although the number of officials actually trained on issues related to cooperation with external service providers and document verifications was smaller (52) than initially planned (60), the trainings can be considered successful.</p>
--	--

1.1.4	<p>Milliseid edusamme tehti liikmesriikide panuse suurendamiseks koostöö tugevdamisel kolmandates riikides tegutsevate liikmesriikide vahel seoses kolmandate riikide kodanike vooga liikmesriikidesse, sh ebaseadusliku sisserände ärahoidmine ja selle tõkestamine, ning koostööga kolmandate riikidega selles valdkonnas, ja milline osa oli selles fondil?</p>
	<p>No actions aiming at strengthening the consular cooperation between Member States are implemented within the Estonian national programme for ISF.</p> <p>Estonian Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA) participates currently in the Consular Cooperation Mechanism (CCM) project as a partner for which Belgium acts as a lead Member State. The project aims at setting up a CCM on Schengen Visa Processing in commonly agreed third countries. It means that the participating Member States will hire in selected countries a document verification officer (DVO) (mostly a local), who performs the verification of locally issued supporting documents (not travel documents). As a result, the knowledge and skill to verify authenticity of such documents will be generated in these countries.</p> <p>The implementation of the project, however, has been severely delayed and several participating Member States have already stepped out of the project. Estonian Ministry of Foreign Affairs planned to hire a local DVO in Minsk but due to the delays in the project and the earlier start of the Estonian Presidency, the contract between Estonia and Belgium has not been signed. Currently, the</p>

	project activities have been postponed and it is not yet clear whether Estonia decides to remain in the project or not.
--	---

1.1.5	Millist edu saavutati IT-süsteemide, nende sideinfrastruktuuri ja seadmete paigaldamisel ja kasutamisel ühise viisapoliitika toetamiseks ja milline osa oli selles fondil?
	<p>In order to support common visa policy, computers for employees dealing with processing of Schengen visa applications and VIS fingerprint scanners have been acquired within the Estonian national ISF programme.</p> <p>The updating of computers used in consulates was necessary because the time required for visa processing had become unreasonably long due to the depreciated computers, especially during the high periods of lodging visa applications. Therefore, in order to ensure a more effective, faster, smoother and customer-friendly visa processing (including fingerprint acquisition) altogether 36 desktop computers with monitors and 11 laptop computers were procured and delivered to 16 consular representations which provide visa service. The equipment is used in all the 16 consulates and as of 31 December 2015, the representations have started with the acquisition of fingerprints as well. As a result of the project not only visa processing is more efficient, but working conditions of the officials processing Schengen visas have also improved (work places are more ergonomic).</p> <p>The start of renewing of VIS fingerprint scanners was delayed as during the planning process of project activities it appeared that the speed of the fingerprint scanners that were planned to acquire is not sufficient to carry out high-quality and operative visa procedures. Nevertheless, the defects were eliminated and altogether 39 scanners were acquired and delivered to necessary workplaces. As a result of the project, the required quality of fingerprint acquisition is ensured.</p> <p>The purchase of computers and fingerprint scanners has contributed to the achievement of the expected results – effective processing of visa applications and provision of customer-friendly services to visa applicants – set during the Policy Dialogue held between the European Commission and Estonia when planning the use of ISF for the period 2014–2020. Therefore, both activities implemented within the programme have well supported the application of the common visa policy which among other things foresees that Member States should ensure that the quality of the service (processing of visa applications) offered to the public is of a high standard and follows good administrative practices. The activities have also performed well in terms of a related indicator – the number of consulates developed or upgraded with the help of the Fund (23) has already exceeded the target level (18).</p>

1.1.6	Kuidas aitas määruse (EL) nr 515/2014 artiklis 10 sätestatud tegevustoetus kaasa ühise viisapoliitika erieesmärgi saavutamisele?
	As Estonia is not using the operating support within the ISF, the evaluation question is not applicable.

1.2	esmärk 2: Riigipiirid / ISF-B artikli 3 lõike 2 punkt b
	<p>Üldine küsimus: Kuidas aitas fond kaasa järgmiste erieesmärkide saavutamisele:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- integreeritud piirihalduse toetamine, sealhulgas edendades piirihaldusega seotud meetmete edasist ühtlustamist vastavalt liidu ühiste nõuetele ning vahetades teavet liikmesriikide vahel ning liikmesriikide ja Euroopa Liidu Liikmesriikide Välispiiril Tehtava Operatiivkoostöö Juhtimise Euroopa Agentuuri vahel?</li> <li>- ühelt poolt välispiiride ühetaolise ja kõrgetasemelise kontrolli ning kaitse tagamine, sh ebaseadusliku sisserände tõkestamise teel, ja teiselt poolt välispiiride sujuv ületamine kooskõlas Schengeni õigustikuga, tagades samal ajal rahvusvahelise kaitse neile, kes seda vajavad, vastavalt liikmesriikide võetud kohustustele inimõiguste valdkonnas, mis hõlmab ka mittetagasisaatmise põhimõtet?</li> </ul>
	<p>The contribution of the actions of the Estonian national ISF programme to the implementation of integrated border management has been to date rather noticeable. One of the preconditions for harmonisation of border management-related measures in accordance with common Union standards is to have skilled and knowledgeable officials involved in the border management. As a result of trainings conducted with the support of the Fund, the potential for the effectiveness of implementing border management-related measures and capability of border guarding have substantially improved. The skills and knowledge gained are used on a daily basis by the border guard and customs officials and cooperation between the two authorities has enhanced. Though the target value of the indicator concerning the number of staff trained in border management related aspects has not yet been achieved (81% of target level), interest towards the trainings allows suggesting that by the end of the programme it will be reached.</p> <p>Uniform and high level of control and protection of the external borders has already been supported by numerous actions undertaken by applying the financial resources of the Fund. A great deal of focus has been put on improving the communication aspect in securing the external border. For that purpose, maritime radio and data communication systems and border surveillance and control communication equipment have been upgraded. Additionally, VPN and network devices have been installed in the border crossing points, cordons and different vehicles. This has resulted in a strengthened security of communication while guarding the external border. In order to improve the surveillance capability in the areas with difficult access, multirotors have been acquired, which help to resolve potential border incidents (including illegal border crossings). Also the equipment used for migration surveillance has been renewed to a certain extent with the support of the Fund (e.g. procurement of patrol vehicles and mobile</p>

	workstations for border guard vehicles). Regarding the number of border control (checks and surveillance) means developed with the help of Fund, then the target level has already been exceeded by the interim evaluation.
--	---

1.2.1	<p>Millist edu saavutati poliitika kujundamise, elluviimise ja täitmise tagamise edendamisel, et tagada, et isikuid sisepiiride ületamisel ei kontrollita, ja milline osa oli selles fondil?</p>
	<p>The development, implementation and enforcement of policies with a view to ensure the absence of any controls on persons when crossing the internal borders is promoted by the Fund mainly by renewing the equipment used for migration surveillance. Migration surveillance can be seen as one of the compensatory measures in order to contribute to the aforementioned objective (to ensure the absence of any controls on persons when crossing the internal borders) as because of the absence of controls on persons (regardless of their nationality), the risk of possible illegal migration is higher.</p> <p>With the support of the Fund, mobile workstations have been procured and installed into 62 border guard vehicles, enabling fast migration surveillance. It is possible to make on-line inquiries from a car to different databases in order to check for possible irregular migration. The feedback received so far from the users has been positive in majority – better availability of information and user-friendliness of the system allows performing relevant duties more efficiently and effectively.</p> <p>Following the fulfilment of the migration rules has been enabled also by procuring patrol vehicles (93) for the Police and Border Guard Board. Purchasing of minibuses (10) has particularly raised the capability to process on-site offenses, including illegal border crossings and other border offenses. In order to conduct border control and to react to border incidents in areas with rough terrain and under difficult weather conditions, special transport was acquired within the national ISF programme. The special transport vehicles were modified according to the ambitions of the beneficiary and thereby are even more consistent with the specific needs of the users than originally expected. The special vehicles, which are technically capable and with optimal equipment, enable to efficiently perform patrolling-related tasks under different conditions.</p> <p>In addition, it has been possible to renew specific equipment for migration surveillance. By today, 55 USB microscopes have been acquired which enable to conduct document verification regardless of the location of the inspection. This mobile tool can be connected to a laptop and thereby used in patrol vehicles.</p> <p>The capability to react to border incidents (e.g. illegal border crossings) will be improved also by the procurement of watercrafts. The project is still ongoing, but the majority of the motorboats and scooters have been procured and currently in use by the border guard. The watercrafts acquired enhance the effectiveness of patrolling activities and operational response to different border incidents.</p>

--	--

1.2.2	Millist edu saavutati isikute kontrolli ja tõhusa seire teostamisel välispiiride ületamisel ja milline osa oli selles fondil?
	<p>In order to carry out checks on persons and monitor efficiently the crossing of external borders a development of single point of contact (SPOC) for certificate verification has been initiated with the support of the Fund. This project is necessary for the purpose of following the obligations of the Commission Decision C(2008)8657/F1 (laying down a certificate policy as required in the technical specifications on the standards for security features and biometrics in passports and travel documents issued by Member States and updating the normative reference documents).</p> <p>During the elaboration of the architectural design of the complete ICT solution for the SPOC the actual needs were specified and as a result, it became clear that the budget foreseen in the grant agreement is not sufficient to successfully perform all the necessary works. As it was not possible to involve additional funding, the scope of the SPOC development was slightly revised (including extension of the project deadline). Despite the difficulties faced at the early stage, the certificates exchange service SPOC is developed by today and the solution is operational. In the near future compatibility testing with other countries will be undertaken and the system will be fully operational by May 2019. For Estonia SPOC allows access to biometric data contained in machine-readable biometric travel documents issued by the Member States and vice versa. Compared to the possibilities currently used for personal identification, the new information system offers a significantly higher level of security and reliability where document falsification and use of false identities are virtually eliminated. That way correct authentication and security of external borders is better ensured and illegal migration is prevented.</p> <p>Carrying out checks on persons will be supported also through the project where installing of the automated border control (ABC) gates to Narva-1 border crossing point will be planned. A required documentation (feasibility of installing the gates in desirable location) and infrastructure adjustment budget that will be developed as a result of the project form a prerequisite for setting up ABC gates in the future.</p>

1.2.3	Millist edu saavutati välispiiridel solidaarsusele ja vastutusele tugineva integreeritud haldussüsteemi järkjärgulisel rakendamisel ja milline osa oli selles fondil?
	As the actions implemented within the Estonian national ISF programme do not contribute to establishing gradually an integrated management system for

	external borders, based on solidarity and responsibility, the evaluation question is not applicable.
--	--

1.2.4	<p>Millist edu saavutati piirihaldust reguleeriva liidu õigustiku kohaldamise tagamisel ja milline osa oli selles fondil?</p>
	<p>Application of the Union’s acquis on border management has primarily been supported by carrying out trainings for the Police and Border Guard (PGPB) officials and officers of the Estonian Tax and Customs Board (ETCB). The main goal of the trainings has been to increase the professional skills and knowledge of the officials so that they could execute their tasks according to the requirements of the Union’s acquis on border management.</p> <p>As a result of the training (for PGPB officials dealing with processing of visa applications) which focused on the issues related to Visa Information System (VIS), capturing of fingerprints and visa register, the processing of Schengen visa applications at the external borders is smoother, of high-quality and security of the Schengen area is better ensured. The quality of captured fingerprints has improved as well. The feedback received from the officials on the training was very good as it contained both theoretical and practical aspects which can be applied to perform their daily duties.</p> <p>The PGPB officials are also trained with the aim to ensure a more effective EU border control. For that purpose, foreign language trainings (Russian, English, and Finnish), trainings related to introducing different cultures, 2nd level border control, and behavioural and communication psychology have been carried out. In addition, the officials have been trained on certain legislative aspects (legal bases of the temporary stay of aliens in Estonia) and on how to use video spectral comparators with the support of the Fund. The trainings carried out to date have been broad-based and multi-faceted, so that the professionalism and expertise of the officials involved in guarding the external border could be ensured. The gained skills and knowledge are used on a daily basis by the officials while checking and communicating with people crossing the border. On the whole, as a result of trainings, the potential for the effectiveness of implementing border control measures and capability of border guarding has substantially improved. Also the number of officials trained to date (652) is considerably higher than initially planned (430) and two trainings are yet to be conducted – this has mainly been due to the tight competition in the training market resulting in lower prices offered at the time of arranging the trainings.</p> <p>Since as of 2014 (due to the amendment of the Estonian State Border Act) the customs officials have the rights and obligations to check persons and vehicles crossing the Estonian border, there was a need to train the officials of the ETCB so that they could carry out border checks in line with the Schengen Border Code. By the time of the interim evaluation 53 (planned 60) ETCB officials have been trained with the support of the Fund. The final exam related to the training was passed by 42 officials, who are now familiar with the organisation and principles of border control, are capable of performing 1st level border control of</p>

	persons and vehicles, and have the skill to detect offences at the border. The practical part of the training was carried out in cooperation of the PBGB and ETCB, which resulted not only in the raised capacity of the officials, but developed further the collaboration between the two organisations.
--	--

1.2.5	Milliseid edusamme tehti, et aidata kaasa välispiiridel olukorrast informeerituse ning liikmesriikide reageerimisvõime tugevdamisele, ja milline osa oli selles fondil?
	As the actions implemented within the Estonian national ISF programme do not contribute to reinforcing situational awareness at the external borders and the reaction capabilities of Member States, the evaluation question is not applicable.

1.2.6	Millist edu saavutati IT-süsteemide, nende sideinfrastruktuuri ja välispiiridel piirikontrolli ning piirijärelevalvet toetavate seadmete paigaldamisel ja selle kasutamisel ja milline osa oli selles fondil?
	<p>There are several actions implemented with the support of the Fund that contribute to the progress towards setting up and running IT systems, their communication infrastructure and equipment that support border checks and border surveillance in Estonia.</p> <p>To improve the quality of border checks on water bodies, one of the border patrol ships was equipped with satellite and data communication equipment and 1-year satellite data communication package. In addition, the computer network of the ship was upgraded. In the areas not covered with communication links, new medium and short wave radio stations were installed with the support of the Fund. As a result, the capacity to perform proper border checks in the economic zone of Estonia has been ensured due to the more reliable and modern radio and data communication.</p> <p>Prior to the ISF Fund, due to the depreciation of the communication equipment, it was not possible to ensure a secure information exchange between different border guard patrols. Hence, it was decided to use the financial resources of the Fund to upgrade border surveillance and control communication equipment. Within the project ESTER (Estonian Emergency Radio) terminals were installed into border guard vehicles together with weather-proof additional equipment. Portable ESTER terminals were acquired for the purpose of enabling the capability of encrypted radio communication. Today it can be said that as a result of upgrading the equipment, the security of communication while guarding the Estonian state border is better ensured. The new equipment allows proper surveillance of state border and helps to prevent irregular crossings.</p>

	<p>With regard to the enhancement of information systems, the quality of using ICT services has improved by more reliable, modern and faster data communications developed with the support of the Fund. Altogether 80 VPN and network devices were installed in the border crossing points, guard stations (cordons) and different vehicles (e.g. boats). In addition, radar surveillance network has been equipped with 8 routers. Although the amount of procured devices is slightly smaller than initially planned (98), the expectation on the quality of the services to be provided has in general been met. Also, some radio links have been installed to cordons and radar positions at the external land border and thereby preconditions for a faster and higher data volume transmission have been created.</p> <p>Additionally, widening of the coverage of the operative radio communication network has been initiated within the national programme, which should result among other things in an improved communication capability between border guards. Regrettably, due to the insufficient availability of human resources and bringing of the Estonian Presidency to an earlier period (it was decided not to make changes in the network during the high period of the Presidency), the implementation of the activities has not followed the initial plan.</p> <p>One of the success stories in terms of improving the detection capabilities of illegal border crossings has been the decision to acquire unmanned aerial vehicles (multirotors) for surveillance at the external border within the national programme. One of the main advantages of the multirotors is that it expands the overall overview about the situation at external border (especially in areas difficult to access). Although the project is not completely finalised yet, it is expected that the searches conducted by patrols in order to resolve border incidents take less time and are more effective as the use of multirotors will likely diminish the need to apply human resources.</p> <p>Border surveillance will also be supported by acquiring thermal imaging and night vision equipment for the border guard vessels. As a result, it is expected that the protection of EU external border and the capacity of detecting violations will be improved. The purchase process, however, has been disrupted due to the higher cost of cameras than initially foreseen.</p> <p>One of the ongoing projects focuses on improving SIS II functionalities, usability and data quality. SIS II functionalities contribute to the strengthening of the integrated border management by helping to promote the exchange of information between Member States and to improve cooperation between authorities. By today, the first version of the system has been uploaded to the production environment of SIRENE, which enables more efficient work processes and use of the system for users.</p>
--	---

1.2.7	Kuidas aitas määruse (EL) nr 515/2014 artiklis 10 sätestatud tegevustoetus kaasa piirihalduse erieesmärgi saavutamisele?
-------	--

	As Estonia is not using the operating support within the ISF, the evaluation question is not applicable.
--	--

1.3	esmärk 5: Kuritegevus / ISF-P artikli 3 lõike 2 punkt a
	<p>Üldine küsimus: Kuidas aitas fond kaasa järgmiste erieesmärkide saavutamisele:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- piiriülese, raske ja organiseeritud kuritegevuse, sealhulgas terrorismi ärahoidmine?</li> <li>- liikmesriikide õiguskaitseasutuste ja muude riiklike ametiasutuste, sh Europoli või muude asjakohaste liidu asutuste ning asjaomaste kolmandate riikide ja rahvusvaheliste organisatsioonide tegevuse koordineerimise ja koostöö tugevdamine?</li> </ul>
	<p>There are various actions implemented with support of the Fund which contribute to the prevention of cross-border, serious and organised crime (including terrorism). The programme has, however, paid a little less attention to enhancing coordination and cooperation between law enforcement authorities and other national authorities. As several actions are still ongoing, the achievement level of objectives is not yet complete.</p> <p>The progress made within the national ISF programme in strengthening Estonia's capacity to combat different forms of crime can be considered rather significant. Several projects have been completed and produced results which have already been put into practice. The majority of the positive impact derives from actions which have focused on renewing the equipment and developing IT solutions relevant for a more effective performance of law enforcement authorities. As an example, the introduction of new mobile workstations in the police cars has created preconditions for more effective crime prevention (including terrorism). The potential to identify and prevent potential misdemeanour of crime has increased as a result of installing automatic number plate recognition systems into customs vehicles and x-rays in the border crossing points.</p> <p>The programme has supported the progress also in the field of combating illicit drug trafficking in Estonia. A new narcotics tester elaborated within the programme is unique and resource-efficient and it is able to detect certain narcotic drugs in human saliva at concentrations, which are in many cases lower than the regulations of different countries require. The efficiency of drug use control has also been enhanced as a result of acquiring narcotics analysers – the scope of the detection of substances is wider, more accurate and the time it takes to test is approximately twice shorter in comparison with rapid tests used so far.</p> <p>The programme has also provided opportunities for law enforcement officials to participate in different trainings (e.g. in the field of drug d detection) and study tours in order to improve their professional skills and knowledge. Regarding the target level of the indicator related to the number of law enforcement officials trained with the help of the Fund, it has already been reached and somewhat</p>

	exceeded (138% of the target level). The feedback given by the participants has been positive as well.
--	--

1.3.1	<p>Millist edu saavutati oodatud eesmärkide saavutamisel liikmesriikide suutlikkuse suurendamiseks piiriülese, raske ja organiseeritud kuritegevuse, sealhulgas terrorismi vastu võitlemisel ja nende vastastikuse koostöö tugevdamiseks selles valdkonnas, ja milline osa oli selles fondil?</p>
	<p>The progress made within the national ISF programme in strengthening Estonia's capacity to combat different forms of crime can be considered rather significant. Several projects have been completed and produced results which have already been put into practice.</p> <p>One of the success stories of the Estonian ISF programme has been the development of new police mobile workstations. Prior to the ISF, the computer systems in police cars had been in use for more than 10 years and were no longer sufficiently reliable. By the time of the interim evaluation, the new e-police solution is ready to use altogether in 150 police vehicles. The feedback received so far from the users has been positive in majority – better availability of information and user-friendliness of the system allows to perform duties in a more efficient and effective manner. On a wider scale, the introduction of new mobile workstations has created preconditions for more effective crime prevention. Some of the functionalities of the system have already proven useful in case of activities aimed at preventing the threat of terrorism (e.g. the system enables to monitor the routes of delegations escorts related to the Estonian Presidency). The system will be further developed during the remaining period of the programme (software will be upgraded with new functions).</p> <p>The programme's actions have also contributed to a more effective combating and preventing of drug trafficking in Estonia. As a result of one project, a new, resource-efficient and unique narcotics tester was elaborated, which is able to detect certain narcotic drugs in human saliva at concentrations, which are in many cases lower than the regulations of different countries require. The main advantages of the CE methodology include short analysis time (the procedure takes approximately 15 minutes), economical use of reagents, minimum sample requirements and it can easily be miniaturized. The prototype has already been used in real life situations, but will be further developed within an ISF-funded follow-up project. It is expected that in the next two years (depending on the updating of the related legislation in Estonia), the results produced by the device can be used as an evidence in court proceedings and thereby contribute to preventing and combating crime. The efficiency of drug use control has also been enhanced as a result of acquiring narcotics analysers within the programme – the scope of the detection of substances is wider, more accurate and the time it takes to test is approximately twice shorter in comparison with rapid tests used so far. It has been calculated that the cost of tests performed with electronic narcotics tester during one year is ca 96 285 € (ca 167 657 € in case of speed tests).</p>

	<p>For the purpose of identifying and preventing potential misdemeanour or crime, automatic number plate recognition systems (ANPRS) have been installed into customs vehicles and x-rays taken into use in border crossing points. The x-rays were installed into places where they were missing or outdated – as a result the potential for detecting prohibited goods (e.g. drugs, prohibited firearms, smuggled cigarettes) in baggage has improved in those border crossing points. ANPRS facilitate better detection of vehicles of interest at national level (e.g. in case the vehicle has escaped from the customs point) and to carry out pursuit activities within criminal proceedings.</p> <p>With regard to the enhancement of information systems, the quality of using ICT services has improved by more reliable, modern and faster data communications developed with the support of the Fund. Altogether 191 VPN and network devices were purchased and installed into the buildings of the Police and Border Guard Board. Although the amount of procured devices is smaller than initially planned (273), the expectation on the quality of the services to be provided has in general been met.</p> <p>There are also several ongoing Fund actions which contribute to the increase in the capability of combating and preventing crime. For instance, in order to be more efficient in the fight against cybercrime, the effectiveness of processing digital evidence will be increased through trainings and developing necessary software solutions. Furthermore, data archive containing the digital evidence will be established (all equipment, platforms and archives acquired should be working by March 2018). In addition, vehicles for fighting serious and latent crime (7 cars were purchased in the financial year of 2016) and software solution for preventing corruption and detecting crime will be procured and the positioning accuracy of user equipment in mobile networks will be improved. Also the development of the software solution for the Estonian PNR system will contribute to the fight against crime.</p>
--	--

1.3.2	<p>Millist edu saavutati haldus- ja operatiivkoordineerimise ja koostöö tugevdamisel liikmesriikide ametiasutuste, Europol'i ja muude asjaomaste liidu organite ning vajaduse korral kolmandate riikide ja rahvusvaheliste organisatsioonidega ja milline osa oli selles fondil?</p>
	<p>There are only a few activities implemented in the framework of the Estonian national programme which among other things aim at developing administrative and operational coordination between public authorities. As the projects are ongoing, the final results are still not achieved. Therefore, by the time of the interim evaluation, no remarkable progress can be detected in this particular field.</p> <p>Better coordination between different public authorities is supported by widening the coverage of the operative radio communication network, which allows more efficient performance of police duties (e.g. ensuring public safety) and thereby ensures an additional capacity in managing security risks in cooperation of relevant organisations. The implementation of the project, however, has been</p>

	<p>affected by insufficient availability of relevant human resources in the beneficiary organisation and by the circumstance that Estonian Presidency was shifted to an earlier period. As operative radio communication has high importance in facilitating secure communication during the events related to the Presidency, it was decided not to make changes in the network during the high period of the Presidency. By today, locations for the base stations that will be built have been selected and preliminary research has been carried out. As the implementation of the project has not followed the initial schedule, it is planned to apply for the extension of the eligibility period.</p> <p>In addition, at the beginning of 2017, a development project for Passenger Name Record (PNR) IT System was initiated with the support of the Fund. The collection and processing of PNR data is an important law enforcement tool allowing to prevent, detect and investigate terrorism and other forms of serious crime (such as drugs and human trafficking, child sexual exploitation and others). The PNR data or the result of processing PNR data can be exchanged between Member States and with Europol, on a case-by-case basis, to enhance the effectiveness of PNR processing at the level of the European Union. During the first phase of the project, it is planned to develop a preliminary software solution for the Estonian PNR system which would meet the requirements of the PNR Directive (Directive 2016/18) at a minimum level. In the following stages the functionality of the system will be improved according to the new or specified needs and requirements which have emerged during the use of the system. As the project is in its early stage, no specific results have been achieved to date.</p>
--	---

1.3.3	<p>Millist edu saavutati selliste koolitusprogrammide väljatöötamisel, mis käsitlevad tehnilisi ja kutsealaseid oskusi ja teadmisi inimõiguste ja põhivabadustega seotud kohustustest, Euroopa koolituspoliitika rakendamisel, sealhulgas liidu õiguskaitse valdkonna töötajate vahetusprogrammide kaudu, ja milline osa oli selles fondil?</p>
	<p>The projects supported by the Fund to date have not focused that much on developing training schemes in implementation of EU training policies, but on providing opportunities for officials to participate in different trainings in order to elaborate their professional knowledge and skills.</p> <p>In order to be better prepared in preventing and combating Illicit drug trafficking, several trainings and study visits were carried out with the support of the Fund for officials dealing with drug trafficking in the Police and Border Guard Board. In total 44 police officers were trained, which was slightly more than planned (41). The feedback given by the participants was very positive – the capability to detect and identify drug related offences has increased. A few examples of the themes covered by the trainings include the recognition of drugs, drug testing methods, preventing internet-based drug trafficking (for that a training scheme was elaborated in cooperation of the Pompidou Group of the European Council to combat drug abuse and illicit trafficking in drugs) and detection of laboratories involved in the manufacture of synthetic drugs. The</p>

	<p>trainings involved both theoretical and practical aspects. In addition, some study visits to different institutions were undertaken (European Monitoring Centre for Drugs and Drug Addiction in Portugal, Central Criminal Police unit in Czech Republic, customs and police in Sweden), primarily for the purpose of information exchange.</p> <p>Additionally, as crime is increasingly moving to Internet, the number of data media containing digital evidence has remarkably grown in recent years. Therefore, in order to be more efficient in the fight against cybercrime, the effectiveness of processing digital evidence was increased among other things through trainings. Altogether 22 (planned 18) officials from the Police and Border Guard Board, Tax and Customs Board, Estonian Internal Security Service and Information System Authority were trained.</p> <p>Increasing the professional skills and knowledge of relevant police officials is supported also through improving the efficiency of gathering criminal intelligence. By the interim evaluation 146 officials (planned 120) have been trained for implementing the modern administrative system of persons involved in secret cooperation (99 passed the training successfully). In addition, external mission to acquire best practice have been undertaken in this field. For instance, Europol was visited in order to identify countries that have been successful in managing the aforementioned system. Also the Drug Enforcement Administration in the USA was visited to gain an overview about structure of the administrative system of persons involved in secret cooperation – the visit served its purpose as potential ideas for establishing the system in Estonia were mapped.</p> <p>During the financial year of 2016, three officers from the Estonian Internal Security Service participated in the Arabic language training. Two of the officers reached a level, which allows to express themselves and to understand elementary topics – for instance to identify the origin of a person, one’s name and some background information about one’s activities. One officer was provided with intensive private language course, where he acquired a legal and political vocabulary. In general, the language trainings served their purpose (language skills are essential in order to carry out the duties of gathering and processing information for preventing terrorism) and therefore it is planned to send more officers abroad for language trainings.</p>
--	--

1.3.4	<p>Millist edu saavutati kuriteotunnistajate ja -ohvrite, sealhulgas terrorismiohvrite tuvastamise ja toetamise meetmete, kaitsemehhanismide ja parimate tavade kehtestamisel ja milline osa oli selles fondil?</p>
	<p>Within the Estonian national programme an awareness campaign was conducted, which aimed at combating crime through the prevention of trafficking of human beings. Since there had been no prevention campaigns targeting wider public in the area of human trafficking in the last 10 years, the awareness campaign was an essential measure in supporting witnesses and victims of crime. Prior to the ISF, dealing with specific cases in the field of victim support, it had become clear that people need more information about the possibilities to receive</p>

	<p>assistance on state level. However, on a wider scale, no remarkable contribution can be expected from one project only, hence, there is still room for progress in this area.</p> <p>The awareness campaign focused on three themes – labour exploitation, sexual exploitation and minors as victims of forced begging and forced crime. With regard to the last topic (minors), initially it was planned to pay attention only to forced begging, but recent statistics did not demonstrate it as a very serious issue in Estonia. Instead, there had been an increase in cases where minors are forced to commit crimes (e.g. thefts, possession and sale of drugs in smaller amounts). Therefore, it was decided to widen the scope of the third topic in the campaign.</p> <p>Since the project was only completed recently, its impact cannot be assessed at the moment. Nevertheless, all the planned activities were implemented and the outcomes include for instance information, learning and communication materials which have already been applied as part of lectures given in schools in order to raise awareness about human trafficking. The materials are also available online and can be used by different target groups (e.g. NGOs) for communication activities. The main expectation is that as a result of the campaign, there will be an increase in people’s awareness about labour and sexual exploitation, human trafficking as a crime, its different forms and possibilities for receiving help. Also, it is expected that people have received advice on early noticing of the potential case of human trafficking and more people turn to aid organisations and state authorities in order to find solution to a possible case of exploitation and human trafficking.</p>
--	--

1.4	esmärk 6: Riskid ja kriisilukorrad / ISF-P artikli 3 lõike 2 punkt b
	<p>Üldine küsimus: Kuidas aitas fond suurendada liikmesriikide suutlikkust tõhusalt juhtida julgeolekuriske ja ohjata kriise ning kaitsta inimesi ja elutähtsaid infrastruktuure terroriaktide ja muude julgeolekuga seotud intsidentide eest?</p>
	<p>There are various actions implemented within the Estonian national programme for ISF which contribute to the assessment, prevention, preparedness and consequence management of terrorism, and other security-related risks and crisis. As large part of actions is still ongoing, the achievement level of objectives is not yet complete.</p> <p>Reinforcing of the administrative and operational capacity to protect critical infrastructure and people in Estonia has primarily been supported through the acquisition of different equipment and tools and development of information systems with the help of the ISF Fund. A great deal of attention has been turned on ensuring the safety of rescue workers (e.g. through the acquisition of small bomb robots and heavy bomb suits) and increasing a general capacity of CBRN (e.g. through purchase of personal protective equipment). On programme level, the target level of the tools-related indicator has already been reached and even</p>

	<p>exceeded (almost 14 times). On one side it demonstrates a good performance of the programme; on the other hand the target level might not be ambitious enough.</p> <p>The programme has also contributed rather substantially to the enhancement of information systems to support effective and coordinated response to crisis, and preparation of risk and threat assessments. A few examples include acquiring of the database for identifying unknown substances used for attacks, development of modern and faster data communications, introducing of the explosive ordnance disposal information system. As a result, by the time of the interim evaluation, the capabilities to collect, analyse, handle and store risk and crises related information has already improved. Moreover, the security of links between relevant early warning and crisis cooperation actors has enhanced as well.</p> <p>The implementation of cooperation activities in order to raise the capacity in the field of risk and crisis management has been fairly modest to date. This is further confirmed by the relevant indicator – only 4 out of planned 52 (target) expert meetings, workshops have been organised with the help of the Fund. However, the officials who have participated in different seminars, conferences and trainings have provided a very positive feedback as the knowledge and skills gained have proved to be very useful in performing their duties.</p>
--	--

1.4.1	<p>Millist edu saavutati liikmesriikide haldusliku ja operatiivsuutlikkuse suurendamisel, et kaitsta elutähtsat infrastruktuuri kõikides majandusharudes, sealhulgas avaliku ja erasektori partnerluse ning parema koordineerimise, koostöö, liidus ja asjaomastes kolmandates riikides oskusteabe ja kogemuste vahetamise ja levitamise teel, ja milline osa oli selles fondil?</p>
	<p>Reinforcing of the administrative and operational capacity to protect critical infrastructure in Estonia has primarily been supported through the acquisition of different equipment and tools and development of information systems with the help of the ISF Fund. Altogether seven projects financed by the ISF contribute directly to the protection of critical infrastructure and the content-related activities of five of these have already been completed. The finalised projects have accomplished their expected results although in case of one project the number of equipment to be acquired remained slightly below the target level due to the external factors.</p> <p>Prior to the ISF programme the fields of demining and CBRN were rather severely underfunded, investments were mainly one-off (not sustainable) and renewing of equipment relied substantially on the support from US government agencies. At the time of the interim evaluation, it can be concluded that the capability of elimination of bomb and explosion threat and effectiveness to respond to CBRN incidents has already increased. The 6 heavy bomb suits and 5 small bomb disposal robots, which were distributed between regional bomb groups and CBRN team, have already been used in solving various incidents. The robots are especially crucial in neutralizing or removing explosive devices from locations that are narrow or hard to access. In addition, these can be used in organising observation of the incident location in case of an armed crime or other</p>

dangerous situations. The bomb robots and bomb suits also help to ensure the protection of life and health of rescue workers. The capabilities in the field of CBRN have also been raised through the purchase of personal protective equipment (e.g. 20 suits and masks) and modification of the radiation vehicle, which enables more effective and efficient response to incidents.

With regard to the enhancement of information systems, the quality of using ICT services in the buildings and vehicles of the Rescue Board has improved by more reliable, modern and faster data communications developed with the support of the Fund. Altogether 76 VPN and network devices were purchased and installed to the rescue centres, commandos, crisis management buses and containers for protection of critical infrastructure. Although the amount of procured devices is smaller than initially planned (114), the expectation on the quality of the services to be provided has in general been met. Regarding the capability to identify chemical and biological substances on site, it was practically lacking in Estonia before the implementation of the programme. Today, the database acquired with the ISF support has substantially facilitated everyday work in identifying and analysing unknown substances and thereby given a unique capability.

The contribution of the programme to the reinforcing of the administrative and operational capacity to protect critical infrastructure in Estonia through cooperation activities has been fairly modest. However, by the time of interim evaluation, one cooperation seminar in the UK and CBRN conference was attended by the officials of the Estonian Internal Security Service, which proved to be useful in increasing knowledge about the up-to-date technological opportunities and developments in the field of CBRN. The experience of the beneficiaries also confirms that such projects can be beneficial in finding new cooperation partners both at national and international level and thereby increase the credibility of the organisation. The network of contacts established will likely form a basis for further developments in the future.

In terms of the future, the programme will potentially contribute to further progress in raising the capability to protect critical infrastructure as the planned activities of the programme foresee establishment of data archive containing the digital evidence and information about proceedings to enable availability of rescue and emergency data for 10 years. In addition, capability to analyse CBRN and EOD incidents will be created places for storing and destruction of explosives in accordance with the requirements will be established. As a result, safety of people and the surrounding environment (including critical infrastructure) will increase.

As a result of the programme, not only the capacity of protecting critical infrastructure against security-related incidents has enhanced, but ensuring the protection of people's everyday life in a broader sense has reached a new level. A wider impact can also be detected at EU level as representatives of several countries have visited the Ministry of Interior in Estonia to get acquainted with the benefits of the bomb robots. The successful implementation of the project has strengthened their confidence in the equipment itself, but also in the feasibility of such projects.

1.4.2	<p>Millist edu saavutati turvaliste ühenduste ja tõhusa koordineerimise loomisel olemasolevate valdkonnapõhiste varajase hoiatamise ja kriisikoostöös osalejate vahel nii liidu kui ka riiklikul tasandil, ja milline osa oli selles fondil?</p>
	<p>Altogether four projects financed by the ISF contribute to establishing secure links and effective coordination between existing sector-specific early warning and crisis cooperation actors at national level. As only one of the projects has been completed, the progress resulting from the programme activities in this field has been moderate.</p> <p>One of the focus points of the programme in ensuring secure links between relevant early warning and crisis cooperation actors has been on renewing the data communication devices which had become depreciated and even caused 5 critical incidents in 2014. Today it can be said that the quality of using ICT services in the buildings and vehicles of the Rescue Board has improved as a result of more reliable, modern and faster data communications developed with the support of the Fund (fewer interruptions and malfunctions). As due to the unexpected changes in USD and EUR currency rates the amount of the devices procured was smaller than initially planned (76 instead of 114), it was not possible to install devices in all necessary places. However, funds from state budget were used to acquire additional number of devices. As the border guard, police and rescue board are increasingly in need of storing video and picture archives, it was decided to establish data archive which would be available for at least 10 years. This is relevant also from the perspective of crisis cooperation. The establishment of the archive containing the digital evidence and information about proceedings to enable availability of rescue and emergency data is still ongoing but with great probability the planned results will be achieved. It should be noted that both activities (renewing of data communication devices and establishment of an archive) are closely connected to IT projects financed within ESIF in Estonia, which focus on the development of primary datacentre infrastructure. It helps to create and manage information systems and services relevant from the perspective of internal security (including those developed within the ISF).</p> <p>Additionally, widening of the coverage of the operative radio communication network has been initiated within the national programme, which should result among other things in the increase of capability of crisis management through more effective coordination between relevant authorities. Regrettably, due to the insufficient availability of human resources and bringing of the Estonian Presidency to an earlier period (it was decided not to make changes in the network during the high period of the Presidency), the implementation of the activities has not followed the initial plan.</p> <p>In the field of cyber defence, a development of a cyber defence monitoring solution is planned as part of the ISF action focusing on early warning and crisis. As the project is at an early stage, no specific results have been achieved yet. However, it is expected that through developing a centralised surveillance IT system of the vital service providers the capability to identify cyber-attacks and malware will improve.</p>

	All in all, although the programme has not yet contributed significantly to the establishment of secure links and effective coordination between early warning and crisis cooperation actors, positive effects will likely emerge at the later implementation stage of the programme.
--	---

1.4.3	Milliseid edusamme tehti selleks, et parandada liikmesriikide ja liidu haldus- ja operatiivsuutlikkust töötada välja laiaulatuslikke ohu- ja riskihinnanguid, ja milline osa oli selles fondil?
	<p>The programme actions aiming at improving the administrative and operational capacity in developing comprehensive threat and risk assessments in Estonia are ongoing and therefore not all the expected results have been achieved by the time of the interim evaluation.</p> <p>Participating in CBRN cooperation projects and trainings is one of the activities within the programme which contributes to improving the capacity related to threat and risk assessments. In 2016 officials of Estonian Internal Security Agency attended a CBRN expert training in the USA and a conference in the UK. According to the feedback of the participants, the knowledge and experience gained was very necessary and exceeded expectations – the training in the USA gave an opportunity to put the theory into practice and perform tasks in difficult and complicated situations. As a result of such experience sharing it is expected that by the end of the programme, Estonian officials act more knowingly and professionally on CBRN scenes and that they will be more skilled in acting together with cooperation partners on the basis of uniform operating methods.</p> <p>Other actions being implemented within the programme focus on the development of information systems. One of the results achieved to date is the development and introducing of the explosive ordnance disposal information system DEMIS which has already been taken into use by the Estonian Explosive Ordnance Disposal Centre in the Rescue Board. The software has met the expectations – the quality and detail of the data connected to the works and findings of the Centre has improved. Also the capability to collect, analyse, handle and store information related to the demining has enhanced. The software will be further elaborated through the development of its functionality and additional modules. The very final result expected is that the risk and threat assessments can be performed with more effective use of resources by the Rescue Board (the necessary information exchange is faster and with higher quality). Additionally, a data warehouse for the Rescue Board and the Emergency Response Centre will be developed within the programme. Currently the first outcome – analysis of data sources and the description of the data sets – has been elaborated. All in all, the developed data warehouse will improve the analysing capacity of the mentioned organisations, which in turn facilitates making more accurate risk and threat assessments and be better prepared for prognosis as well as management of crises.</p>

	The progress towards improving the administrative and operational capacity to develop comprehensive threat and risk assessments in Estonia is underway. However, the programme actions have already produced results which form pre-conditions for more reliable, accurate and efficient risk and threat assessments.
--	---

2	Tõhusus
---	---------

2	<p>Üldine küsimus: Kas fondi eesmärgid saavutati mõistlike kuludega?</p>
	<p>The use of resources for achieving the objectives set in the programme can be considered fairly reasonable. In financial terms, adherence to the budgetary targets has been one of the goals on project level which in general has been reached as the implementation of the projects has largely followed the planned budgets. However, in numerous cases the planning of the project budgets has proved to be rather challenging as the time interval between the planning and the actual implementation of the projects is long. Hence, there have been situations where the projects have not reached the targets on quantity level (e.g. fewer devices acquired than initially foreseen) due to the unexpected rise in prices. But this has not resulted in a significant drawback in terms of quality – the projects completed so far have been in accordance to the ambitions of the beneficiaries and met the majority of their expectations.</p> <p>Project team consisting of 1-2 persons (project manager and/or assistant) who are involved in the daily implementation of the project is a rather common approach applied in managing the ISF projects. The personnel costs have therefore been minimal, which certainly facilitates to direct the majority of financial resources to the content-related activities. On the other hand, it is not always the most reasonable approach in reaching the desired results efficiently as the work load related to project implementation is rather high at certain times. Therefore, in order to avoid the occurrence of overtime (which is often unpaid) and decline in motivation for project managers who often fulfil project related tasks besides their daily duties, an additional support in terms of project team is expected by some of the beneficiaries. This is essential as motivated and experienced project manager and team are part of an effective and efficient accomplishment of the expected results.</p> <p>Although the majority of the projects implemented within the programme have managed to follow the initial time plan, there are projects which have requested an extension of the contracted deadlines in order to achieve the set goals. One of the main reasons that has induced changes in the timetables is connected to the drawbacks faced within the procurement procedures which have been due to the contesting of the procurement results or failure to receive suitable offers. Several procurements have been connected to sophisticated technical systems or equipment and therefore the lack of experience in compiling technical specifications for such systems is sometimes seen as a certain obstacle, which</p>

might negatively affect the results of procurements. In the IT sector, however, the main bottleneck related to the procurements is the deficiency of offers (no offers submitted), which has lately become a rather remarkable hindering factor.

In several cases, a good cooperation between project partners can be viewed as a factor that has positively influenced an efficient implementation of projects and programme in general. Although project teams are typically small, additional support is often provided within the beneficiary organisations (e.g. by lawyers, procurement specialists, accountants) during more complicated phases of the projects in order to reach the goals as efficiently as possible. Naturally, there have also been disagreements and at times information exchange has not been sufficient, but these circumstances have not affected poorly the overall implementation of the projects. The collaboration with contractors has also proved to be beneficial in numerous cases – some of them have demonstrated a great deal of flexibility and provided more input than initially expected (e.g. offered useful solutions and added improvements on their own initiative).

A specific example of efficiency-enhancing factor concerns the application of agile and flexible development methodology by one of the beneficiary organisation within the projects related to the development of different IT solutions. According to the approach the information system is completed piece by piece and each finished component can be promptly tested and used by the client. As a result, it has been possible to fasten the process and improve the system in compliance with the feedback received from the end-user.

Several beneficiaries have reached the conclusion that thorough preparatory activities, including planning of resources (e.g. time, human and financial), is a substantial element in contributing to an efficient achievement of the desired results. For instance, preliminary work carried out before the procurements could include mapping of current situation (e.g. market research) and expected requirements for the equipment to be acquired (so that maximum quality with available resources could be received). A careful planning of human resources is also highly beneficial (in terms of team size and number of working hours), especially in case of long-term projects. Clearly, it is not possible to foresee and exclude all potential factors (including external) that might influence the implementation of projects, but well elaborated technical specifications, budget and a timetable can minimise the risk of using the resources inefficiently. A more specific observation made by the beneficiaries about the efficiency concern the processing of the application to change the grant agreement by the RA, which in their view takes occasionally too long and may cause suspension of activities. Another example regards the trainings on visa processing – within the ISF it is not eligible to reflect processing of long-stay (D) visas during the trainings. As in Estonia the same people deal with the processing of both Schengen and D-visas, it would be more efficient if trainings would involve both types of visas.

Based on the information available, it can be concluded that the projects implemented so far are in general in accordance with grant agreements and have not revealed any significant inconsistencies. The majority of activities have been carried out in compliance with the time plan and the EU funding has been used to date for its intended purpose in line with the national programme.

2.1	Kui suurel määral saavutati fondi oodatud eesmärgid mõistlike kuludega, pidades silmas kasutatud rahalisi vahendeid ja lähetatud inimressursse?
	<p>Regarding human resources, project team is often considered as one of the key factors in securing project's success both in terms of effectiveness and efficiency. However, several representatives of beneficiary organisations perceive that project teams involved in the day-to-day implementation of the projects are too small consisting typically of just 1-2 persons (project manager and/or assistant). In many cases, the project management is an additional commitment to their daily duties and at times the burden related to the project implementation is considered rather high. Therefore, the work load of project managers is not always reasonable and fulfilment of project related tasks outside office hours is regrettably not a rare case. Furthermore, the eligibility rules complicate reimbursement of labour costs if the tasks performed within the project are included in the regular job description. This in turn sometimes causes unnecessary tensions and reduces motivation of project managers. All in all, sometimes insufficient availability of human resources may affect the implementation of the projects and programme in general.</p> <p>The use of financial resources within the programme can in principal considered purposeful and reasonable. Costs associated with the implementation of the projects have largely followed the planned budgets (only a few projects have applied for a budget change) as adherence to the budgetary targets has been one of the goals of the beneficiaries. However, ensuring quality and accomplishment of objectives is also a standard that has been carefully followed. The personnel costs have been minimal and even when the duration of some projects has extended, the share of personnel costs has not increased. Therefore, in view of beneficiaries the use of available financial resources has been so far optimal taking into account the needs to be met. However, in several cases the planning of the project budgets has proved to be rather challenging for beneficiaries as during the budgeting phase it is difficult to precisely estimate the potential costs of necessary equipment in the future (e.g. an unforeseen and significant rise in the price of the small bomb robots due to the increase in the globalised terrorism threat). Also the needs might change slightly due to the external factors (e.g. changes in legislation and increase in visa applications). Although, in some cases, it has been necessary to make concessions in the amount of equipment purchased due to the higher prices than expected, the achievement of the results has not suffered severely.</p> <p>On programme level, the implementation rate (paid EU contribution compared to the programmed EU contribution) of the actions (TA not included) has been very positive – 69% of the planned funds have already been used by the time of the interim evaluation. Furthermore, the share of EU support that has already been covered with contracts is 79% (70% for ISF-B and 92% for ISF-P). Concerning the use of technical assistance (TA) of the national ISF programme, then it has been very conservative as only 8% (11,5% for ISF-P and 6% for ISF-B) of the allocated TA funds have been applied by the interim evaluation. Therefore, the amount of unused TA funds will likely be rather considerable by the end of the programme implementation. The main purpose of the technical assistance has</p>

	<p>been to cover the salaries and mission expenditure of the RA (office costs not covered). The audits carried out to date have confirmed the targeted use of the technical assistance. A modest use rate of TA also means a small actual proportion of technical assistance (only 0,8%) in the total EU contribution paid to date within the programme (the programmed share of TA was 6,6%). Therefore, it can be said that by the time of interim evaluation, administration of ISF project support of 1€ has cost 0,008€ (compared to the 0,02€ within the EBF), which is beneficial from the perspective of efficiency.</p>
--	--

2.2	<p>Missuguseid meetmeid võeti pettusejuhtumite ning muude eeskirjade eiramiste ennetamiseks, avastamiseks, neist teada andmiseks ja järelmeetmete võtmiseks ja kui tõhusad need olid?</p>
	<p>In order to prevent, detect, report and follow up on cases of fraud and other irregularities, the Responsible Authority performs systematic administrative and on-the-spot controls of projects. During the administrative control, which is usually desk based, every progress/final report and payment requests submitted by the beneficiary organisations are checked. The aim is among other things to verify whether the projects are being implemented according to the grant agreement and whether the declared expenditure is relevant and justified. When the control reveals inconsistencies or eligibility concerns, the beneficiary is requested to provide additional clarifications. On-the-spot controls are carried out on the sample basis, which is drawn based on risk assessment (taking into account the cost and length of the projects), the number of procurements involved in the project and the experience of the beneficiary. The aim of the on-the-spot control is in line with the goal of the administrative control.</p> <p>One of the measures applied to prevent irregularities is organising information days by the RA. However, as large part of beneficiaries has already received funding under the External Borders Fund (EBF), they are familiar with the ISF rules, which are rather similar to the rules of the EBF. In addition, project managers are occasionally contacted by the RA to inquire about the status of the project (especially in case of short-term projects which have no reporting obligation).</p> <p>Based on the information available (summaries of administrative and on-the-spot controls, interviews, project reporting), it can be said that projects implemented so far are in general in accordance with grant agreements and have not revealed any significant inconsistencies or cases of fraud. The measures put in place to prevent, detect, report and follow up on cases of fraud and other irregularities have justified themselves.</p>

3	
---	--

	Asjakohasus
--	-------------

3	<p>Üldine küsimus: Kas fondist rahastatud meetmete eesmärgid vastavad tegelikele vajadustele?</p>
	<p>Due to the limited amount of financial resources of the Fund, only the most priority topics were carefully selected for financing during the development of the national programme. Therefore, the content of the objectives and actions of the programme still correspond to the actual needs.</p> <p>However, recent developments in the world demonstrate that new threats (e.g. terrorism) emerge that have to be addressed even more carefully. For instance, in connection with the Estonian Presidency, the demand for the services of deminers has significantly increased (preparation of different summits). Also the prevention of radicalisation, which is not yet a significant threat in Estonia, requires more attention.</p> <p>Several changing needs derive from the obligation to apply various EU requirements. As an example, the extent of work necessary to perform the development and implementation of Entry/Exit System is unclear as the content of the tasks have likely changed compared to the situation at the planning phase. Additionally, the EU's future travel authorisation system ETIAS was not in focus at the time of ISF programming and therefore no specific actions were planned within the programme for ISF in this field. But Estonia supports the establishment of the ETIAS system by law enforcement authorities in order to combat terrorism and other serious crime.</p> <p>Although the Estonian national programme for ISF addresses today's political priorities, the effectiveness of the programme in tackling the emerging issues requires additional financial resources. Especially in the case of preventing and combating terrorism (including radicalisation) more emphasis should be put on investing in equipment and infrastructure and raising competence through trainings. Additional investments are also expected in order to contribute further to EUROSUR (e.g. integration of surveillance system, reliability of ICT systems), harmonisation of border management-related measures in accordance with common Union standards (e.g. Entry/Exit system) and raising national capacity (in terms of border surveillance and checks, e.g. Travel Authorisation System).</p> <p>All in all, no specific changes are needed to enable the national programme to integrate developments in EU and national priorities.</p>

3.1	Kas liikmesriigi riiklikes programmides seatud eesmärgid vastavad kindlaks tehtud vajadustele?

One of the main principles followed when preparing the national ISF programme for the period 2014-2020 was that the measures and objectives of the programme must correspond to the goals of ISF and needs at national level, and result in the increase of the state's capability in the field of visas, surveillance and control of the external border, combating crime and crisis management. The needs to be met with the programme arose primarily from different national strategies related to the area of internal security (e.g. Main Guidelines of Estonia's Security Policy until 2015, Bases of Estonia's Security Policy, and Guidelines for Development of Criminal Policy until 2018).

In the area of visa policy, one of the main problems has been misuse of visas for illegal immigration purpose. Also the increasing number of visa applications has posed a challenge. According to the Internal Security Strategy for 2015-2020 it is substantial to develop visa coordination process and cooperation with consular offices to tackle these issues. Moreover, special attention should be paid to the development of information systems (e.g. visa information system). When looking at the national programme, then all the objectives related to the visa policy address these needs. For instance, joint trainings of consular, police and border guard officials contribute to the implementation of the EU common visa policy and uniform application of the Schengen acquis. The topics chosen for trainings are closely connected to the bottlenecks faced in performing daily duties (e.g. identification of falsified documents, interviewing and profiling).

Regarding the policy area of border management, then large share of ISF resources have been directed to the replacement and/or renewing of different equipment and development of IT solutions in order to contribute to a more effective border control and surveillance. This has been and continues to be necessary among other things due to the general decline in the security situation in the region, increasing border traffic, possible increase in refugee flows and constant pressure from illegal immigration. In 2014, with regard to the incident at the Estonian-Russian border, a need to secure the border rose even more to the spotlight. Therefore there is a clear link between the needs and objectives of the ISF programme in terms of border management.

At the time of planning, prevention of drug-related crimes was one of the most important issues to be addressed with the programme in the field of crime prevention. In addition to drug trafficking, the Internal Security Strategy for 2015-2020 stresses that more attention should be paid to the implementation of measures against human trafficking, cyber-crime, corruption, terrorism and economic crimes in combating serious and organised crime. Furthermore, the Strategy brings out that the capacity of technical capacity of criminal intelligence is insufficient. The objectives of the ISF programme address these needs rather thoroughly as the projects implemented under the specific objective of 'Preventing and combating crime' focus for instance on increasing the capability of pursuit activities, ensuring the reliability and security of ICT systems and enhancing the prevention of terrorism. Due to the limited resources of the ISF, cyber security activities are mostly financed through state budget.

Under the specific objective 'Risks and crisis' the main focus of the programme has been on the fields of demining and CBRN. Prior to the ISF programme, purchasing of demining and CBRN related equipment was inadequate as the development of these areas was not sustainable relying primarily on one-off

	<p>large investments or support from US government agencies. Within the national programme a great deal of attention is turned on ensuring the safety of rescue workers (e.g. through the acquisition of small bomb robots and heavy bomb suits) and increasing a general capacity of CBRN (e.g. through training of officials and investing in the demining and CBRN complex). Therefore, the programme is directly contributing to removing the bottlenecks characteristic to the areas of demining and CBRN.</p>
--	---

3.2	<p>Missuguseid meetmeid võttis liikmesriik muutuvate vajadustega tegelemiseks?</p>
	<p>The Estonian national programme for ISF was compiled according to the principle of flexibility. It means that the description of actions under the national objectives is sufficiently general in order to leave room for certain amendments and additions related to changing needs. For today, the national programme for ISF has been amended once due to the need to address the obligations of the PNR Directive (Directive 2016/681).</p> <p>Information about potential new needs was collected during the interim evaluation through interviews with beneficiaries and policy makers. The mid-term review which aimed at assessing needs for the second half of the ISF implementing period (2018-2020) of the programme was also one of the measures to address the changing needs in the policy fields supported by the ISF. Based on the information collected it can be said that although some new topics have emerged during the implementation phase, they mostly fall into the scope of the existing objectives and actions of the programme. Therefore, the needs/bottlenecks related to the policy areas covered by the Fund have not changed significantly compared to the situation at the time of programming.</p>

4	Sidusus
---	---------

4	<p>Üldine küsimus: Kas riiklikus programmis seatud eesmärgid olid kooskõlas ELi vahenditest rahastatavates muudes programmides seatud eesmärkidega ja kas neid kohaldatai sarnastes töövaldkondades? Kas sidusus oli tagatud ka fondi rakendamise ajal?</p>
	<p>The objectives set in the national programme for ISF concern different areas (visa policy, border management, combating crime, risks and crisis) connected to ensuring security at national and EU level. In majority the actions supported with ISF are rather specific and therefore not eligible for financing from other programmes funded by EU. Prior to the ISF, similar areas (mainly border management and visa issues) have been financed in Estonia through Schengen</p>

	<p>Facility Programme (2004-2007) and/or External Borders Fund 2007-2013 (EBF). Therefore ISF actions can be in several cases viewed as successive and coherent activities to investments made from the two mentioned interventions.</p> <p>The strongest level of coherence can be noticed and expected between the ISF and European Structural and Investments Fund (ESIF) projects focusing on IT developments. In order to recognise opportunities for synergy and to avoid potential overlap with ESIF measures the planning of the ESIF was followed already during the ISF programming phase. Regarding the coherence on programme level, then it has mainly been supported by encouraging cooperation between different projects which has already resulted in making certain changes in the projects to increase the potential impact on programme action level. All in all, several projects implemented within the ISF are closely connected (particularly IT development related projects) and will likely amplify the positive results of the programme.</p> <p>Coherence with the Horizon2020 instrument has also been searched during the implementation of the national programme as connections between the two interventions in terms of supported areas are seen by the RA and beneficiary organisations. However, Horizon2020 projects are commonly large-scale collaboration projects, which require bigger investments and therefore not often considered as a realistic alternative.</p>
--	---

4.1	<p>Kas hinnati sarnaste eesmärkidega muid meetmeid ja kas tulemusi võeti kavandamise etapis arvesse?</p>
	<p>As the national programme for ISF supports rather distinctive actions which are generally not eligible for financing from other programmes funded by EU, then according to the feedback from the Responsible Authority (RA), no specific assessment of other interventions with similar objectives were carried out during the programming stage. The planning of the European Structural and Investments Fund (ESIF), however, was closely followed while drafting the national programme for ISF in order to recognise opportunities for synergy and to avoid potential overlap with ESIF measures.</p> <p>In the application stage the applicants are obliged to give an overview about the projects they have implemented previously in similar areas with support of EU funds or other instruments. In addition, they have to notify whether the final beneficiary is planning to apply for support simultaneously under other instruments. This requirement set in the application form by the RA is one of the measures to ensure coherence of the ISF programme actions with other potential similar EU instruments already in the planning phase. Moreover, it contributes to avoiding overlapping of activities.</p>

4.2	Kas rakendamise perioodiks loodi fondi ja sarnaste eesmärkidega muude meetmete vahel koordineerimismehhanismid?
	<p>During the implementation period of the national programme for ISF, the synergy and coherence of the programme actions with other similar activities supported by other interventions have been followed to a moderate extent. The risk of overlap can be assessed low. In order to identify the possibility to finance innovative projects in the area of internal security, consultations with coordinators of other programmes or instruments have taken place. For instance, as Horizon2020 focuses also on several areas similar to the ISF (e.g. cyber security, fighting crime, illegal trafficking and terrorism, strengthening security through border management), potential financing possibilities have been discussed with the coordinator of the Horizon2020 instrument in the Ministry of the Interior. In addition, scientific councillor of RITA programme (funded by ERDF) has also been approached to identify coherence between the ISF and the programme.</p> <p>Coherence between different actions is also supported on programme level (internally). As an example, one of the beneficiary organisations which implements several ISF projects conducts regularly steering group meetings where project managers can provide an overview about the status of their projects, discuss bottlenecks and detect possibilities for cooperation with other ISF projects. This has occasionally resulted in making certain changes in the projects so to increase the potential impact on programme action level.</p>

4.3	Kas fondi kaudu rakendatud meetmed olid kooskõlas (ja mitte vastuolus) sarnaste eesmärkidega muude meetmetega?
	<p>Rather significant share of the ISF actions that have been implemented to date through the Fund focus on the development of different IT systems necessary to perform duties related to border surveillance, visa policy and other areas relevant to the Fund. Developments in the field of information technology are also financed within the structural funds (ESIF). While ISF actions deliver comparatively specific solutions for providing necessary services (e.g. information system for coordinating visa applications, police mobile workstation development), then several ESIF projects focus on the development of primary datacentre infrastructure which helps to create and manage information systems and services relevant from the perspective of internal security. Briefly, the IT projects funded by the ESIF establish a base which facilitates to provide services in the field of security (including those developed within the ISF). Therefore a fairly high level of synergy can be detected between the two interventions in the field of information technology. A certain degree of ESIF and ISF coherence can also be determined in the area of crime prevention. Namely, within ESIF the Ministry of Interior implements several projects which are mostly directed at the target group of youth and children and thereby contribute to the crime prevention in a longer perspective (e.g. implementation of a programme aiming at including youth with an offence background in the labour market).</p>

	<p>Another example of coherence of ISF actions with other similar interventions is a collaboration project “TARGET” initiated by 11 EU Member States (including Estonia) and financed in the framework of the Horizon2020. The project aims at creating a pan-European platform, which develops the use of Augmented and Virtual Reality (AVR) and serious gaming techniques for the training and competence assessment of first responders (incl. police), counter terrorism units, border guards and critical infrastructure operators. These learning tools complement the ICT developments and equipment purchases (for border surveillance and checks) supported by the ISF, which altogether contribute to a better preparedness and response capacity to different security related incidents.</p> <p>From a more general perspective, the actions implemented through the ISF have also connections to activities supported by the Connecting Europe Facility in Telecom (Cyber Security Call), which supports Member States to create, maintain or expand national capacities to run a range of cyber security services. Additionally, the ISF actions are coherent with the call for proposals "Technical Assistance" under the EU Hercule III Programme, which funds actions to strengthen their operational and administrative capacity of national or regional administrations to fight fraud, corruption and other irregularities perpetrated against the Union's financial interests.</p>
--	--

5	Vastastikune täiendavus
---	-------------------------

5	<p>Üldine küsimus: Kas riiklikus programmis seatud eesmärgid ja vastavad rakendatud meetmed täiendasid muude tegevuspõhimõtete raames seatud eesmäärke, eelkõige liikmesriikide poolt seatud eesmäärke?</p>
	<p>The objectives and corresponding actions set in the national programme complement the priorities determined in different national strategies related to the area of security. The activities supported by the ISF in the field of visa policy are well in accordance with the objective of effective processing of visa applications and provision of customer-friendly services to visa applicants set in the Development Plan of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA). What regards to the area of border management, then prevention, combating and identification of illegal crossing of the state border is seen as one of the priorities within the Development Plan for the Governing Area of the Ministry of the Interior (DPGA). Tackling these aspects is included also by the ISF actions. Internal Security Strategy for 2015-2020 foresees the fight against terrorism, combating serious and organised crime and increasing CBRN and demining related capacity as substantial political instruments in order to ensure the internal security in Estonia. Several financial priorities included in the national programme for ISF contribute to these objectives.</p>

5.1	Kas hinnati üksteist täiendavate eesmärkidega muid meetmeid ja kas seda võeti kavandamise etapis arvesse?
	<p>Under the leadership of the Ministry of the Interior working groups were created in order to identify the needs and goals in different governing areas of the state and prepare the national ISF programme for the EU budget period 2014–2020. The elaboration of the national programme for ISF was based on the assessment of development needs described in different national strategies related to the area of internal security (e.g. Main Guidelines of Estonia’s Security Policy until 2015, Bases of Estonia’s Security Policy, and Guidelines for Development of Criminal Policy until 2018). The authorities involved in the working groups made proposals, from which the actions corresponding to the goals of ISF and needs of the state were chosen. One of the main principles followed was that the measures planned in the programme must result in the increase of the state’s capability in the field of visas, surveillance of the external border and border control, combating crime and crisis management. Complementarity of the programme actions with national priorities was assessed again during the time of the revision of the national programme in 2017 as some national strategies had become outdated.</p>

5.2	Kas rakendamise perioodiks loodi koordineerimismehhanismid fondi ja sarnaste eesmärkidega muude meetmete vahel, et tagada nende vastastikune täiendavus?
	<p>During the implementation period of the national programme for ISF, no specific coordination mechanisms have been established to ensure complementarity of the programme actions with other similar activities supported by other interventions. However, if necessary, the Monitoring Committee of the Fund can decide among other issues (e.g. assesses the level of success of implementing the ISF, make proposals for increasing effectiveness of implementation) on individual questions related to the implementation of the Fund.</p> <p>In addition, consultations with coordinators of other programmes or instruments have taken place. For instance, as Horizon2020 focuses also on several areas similar to the ISF (e.g. cyber security, fighting crime, illegal trafficking and terrorism, strengthening security through border management), potential financing possibilities have been discussed with the coordinator of the Horizon2020 instrument in the Ministry of the Interior.</p>

5.3	Kas rahastamisvahendite kattumise ärahoidmiseks kasutati mingeid mehhanisme?
-----	--

	<p>Prevention of overlapping of different financial instruments has been one of the obligations of the RA both during the planning and implementation phase of the programme. Therefore, potential connections of ISF actions with other interventions have been consciously followed. For instance, the planning of the European Structural and Investments Fund (ESIF) was closely followed while drafting the national programme for ISF in order to recognise opportunities for synergy and to avoid potential overlap with ESIF measures. As the activities financed by the ISF are of rather specific nature and in general not supported by other instruments (both at EU and national level), the risk of overlap can be assessed low.</p> <p>In the application stage the applicants are obliged to give an overview about the projects they have implemented previously in similar areas with support of EU funds or other instruments. In addition, they have to notify whether the final beneficiary is planning to apply for support simultaneously under other instruments. This requirement set in the application form by the RA is one of the measures to avoid overlapping of the ISF programme actions with other instruments already in the planning phase.</p>
--	---

6	ELi lisaväärtus
---	-----------------

6	<p>Üldine küsimus: Kas ELi toetusega loodi lisaväärtust?</p>
	<p>At the moment of the interim evaluation, it can be rather firmly stated that the actions of the ISF would not have been implemented at this scale and timeframe without the support of the Fund. In some cases, the ISF support is even viewed as a basic need and not just an added value in ensuring a high level of security at national and Union level. Although the activities financed in the framework of the programme support the provision of crucial services and some of the actions are directly related to fulfilling EU requirements, the contribution of the state budget as a sole financing source in the supported fields would have likely been smaller and the achievement of the objectives set in the programme and at national level would take longer. Furthermore, if for some reason the implementation of the programme would presently be interrupted, the development of the supported fields would suffer substantially as most likely there would only be capacity to maintain the level of the programme-related services.</p> <p>The qualitative information suggests that the support of the Fund has resulted to a certain extent in all four dimensions of the added value (volume, scope, role, process). The main value of the ISF assistance, however, tends to lie in the fact that the Fund has to date added volume to existing actions in relevant policy</p>

	areas and influenced the capacity of the organisations involved in the programmes.
--	--

6.1	Millist lisaväärtust fondi toetusega peamiselt loodi (maht, kohaldamisala, osatähtsus, protsess)?
	<p>The volume effect of the ISF support has been significant as the actions implemented within the national ISF programme contribute substantially to enhancing the existing provision of services necessary to ensure internal security in Estonia. The equipment purchased and services already developed with support of the Fund are an important addition or replacement to the available but often outdated technical resources. It does not imply, though, that the financial resources of the Fund are used as a substitute for national funding. On the contrary, as the resources allocated from the national budget to the supported fields (visa policy, border management, combating crime and risks and crisis) have primarily been used to maintain the current situation, the Fund creates better preconditions for the sustainability of the services in the field of internal security. Trainings of employees dealing with processing of Schengen visa applications can be seen as a good example of the volume effect of the ISF. Although the Ministry of Foreign Affairs has previously provided occasionally consular officers with seminars and guiding materials, the trainings carried out within the Fund have given an opportunity to improve the skills and knowledge of relevant officials on a much larger scale (both in terms of target group and quantity of trainings).</p> <p>With regard to the scope effect, a general view is that in the absence of the Fund it would likely have been possible to use national resources to cover only smaller expenses as state budget is regarded as a single alternative for actions implemented within the national ISF programme. Therefore, larger investments such as the construction of the CBRN centre would not be possible without the financing of the Fund. Also, it is rather unquestionable that the purchase of utility task vehicles, which have not been used at the Estonian border before, would have been omitted without the national ISF programme. In addition, the Fund has facilitated to meet new needs (mostly arising from EU requirements) such as development and implementation of a Passenger Name Record IT System.</p> <p>Concerning the role effect of the EU added value, then innovation has not been an aim in itself as the selection of actions to be financed under the ISF was to a large extent needs-based. However, the role effect is well characterised by a project which resulted in the elaboration of a prototype for resource-efficient and unique narcotics tester. The prototype has already been successfully used in real life situations, but will be further developed within a follow-up project so that results produced by the device could be used as evidence in court proceedings.</p> <p>As the actions implemented within the national ISF programme have positively influenced the quality of services and capacity of organisations involved in the programme, the process effect of the Fund can be considered fairly significant.</p>

	Updating of equipment (e.g. vehicles, computers) and elaboration of new information systems have already raised the quality of activities and processes necessary to ensure internal security, to an improved level. Regarding the capacity of human resource, the trainings carried out to date within the actions of the ISF have given an opportunity to increase the qualification of different officials which in turn has raised the capability of personnel to perform their tasks in the supported fields in accordance with relevant EU standards.
--	---

6.2	Kas liikmesriik oleks ELi tegevuspõhimõtete rakendamiseks nõutavaid meetmeid fondist toetatavates valdkondades võtnud ka ilma fondi rahalise toetuseta?
	It is clear that as the activities financed in the framework of the programme support the provision of crucial services by the state and as some of the actions are directly related to fulfilling EU requirements (e.g. SIS II, Entry/Exit), there would have been an inevitable need to use national public resources for investing in some of the actions required to implement programme-related EU policies. However, the contribution of the state budget as a sole financing source in those actions would have likely been smaller and the achievement of the objectives set in the programme and at national level would take longer. Moreover, the required investments would have likely been covered at the expense of other activities included in state budget.

6.3	Missugused oleksid fondi antava toetuse katkemise kõige tõenäolisemad tagajärjed?
	The most likely consequences of an interruption of the support provided by the Fund are difficult to foresee. Nevertheless, if for some reason the implementation of the programme would presently be interrupted, the development of the supported fields would suffer substantially as most likely there would only be capacity to maintain the programme-related services. As an example, it was suggested that although the border guard would continue to function in the absence of the Fund support, it would not be up-to-date (e.g. queue at the border would be longer). It is probable that several activities carried out today with the help of ISF would be terminated (e.g. construction of the new CBRN centre, certain trainings) and/or postponed. A larger share of state budget funds would have to be used to finance the ongoing programme activities in order to meet the most priority national objectives. This, however, would definitely require more time (necessary activities will be completed over a long period of time) and thereby negatively influence the advancement of not only the sectors connected to the programme, but of other fields as well (due to the redirecting of state budget funds).

6.4	Millisel määral on fondist toetatavad meetmed toonud kasu liidu tasandil?
	<p>As Estonia has to ensure the guarding and protection of over 1,100 km of external borders of the Schengen Area and over 300 km of European Union's external border, all of the actions supported by the Fund (especially those implemented in the field of border surveillance and visa policy) are to a greater or lesser extent beneficial in providing a higher level of security also at the Union level. For instance, the trainings already carried out for consular officials (e.g. in relation to document security, detecting fraud and security issues, capturing fingerprints) have contributed to creating preconditions for the efficient and uniform application of the Union's acquis on borders and visas. All in all, the national ISF programme involves several activities related to the application of EU requirements (e.g. Entry/Exit System, SIS II, Schengen acquis, Directive 2016/682 (Passenger Name Record)) but since the implementation of the programme is in progress, it is too early to draw clear conclusions on the benefits of the actions at the Union level. However, the potential for benefits can be considered high.</p> <p>The actions of the ISF programme have also enabled experience sharing and finding new cooperation partners at Union level. One specific example of potential utility of programme's actions at the Union level derives from the project related to the elaboration of the prototype for narcotics tester. The prototype has already gained international attention and it is expected that after further development, the device can also be used in other countries in combating crime. Another illustration regards the small bomb disposal robots acquired within the programme – representatives of several EU countries have visited the Responsible Authority to get acquainted with the benefits of the bomb robots in neutralising or removing explosive devices from locations that are narrow or hard to access, and in organising observation of the incident location in case of armed crime or other dangerous situations.</p>

6.5	Milline oli tegevustoetuse lisaväärtus?
	As Estonia is not using the operating support within the ISF, the evaluation question is not applicable.

7	Jätkusuutlikkus
---	-----------------

7	<p>Üldine küsimus: Kas fondist toetatavate projektide positiivne mõju püsib tõenäoliselt ka pärast toetuse lõppemist?</p>
	<p>The sustainability of the projects' effects achieved so far can be assessed rather favourably. The equipment acquired and the systems developed with support of the Fund are necessary to provide services which are crucial in ensuring national security. The risk that the equipment acquired with support of the Fund will be discarded due to the lack of resources for their maintenance is fairly low – the fulfilment of security related tasks have to be guaranteed at least a minimum level. Therefore, it is a national priority to find the required financial resources to ensure that the effects achieved as a result of the implementation of the national programme will continue after the end of the funding period. However, on the basis of past experience with foreign assistance this has not always been an easy assignment, especially when a completely new device has been acquired (previously no maintenance cost needed). In this case necessary resources will be likely ensured at the expense of other activities included in state budget. In recent years, this issue has emerged specifically with regard to the developed IT solutions. Several projects' representatives have also implied that further development (e.g. necessity to add new functionalities) of the IT systems developed with support of the ISF might not be possible if no additional financial resources will be provided at state level.</p>

7.1	<p>Missuguseid peamisi meetmeid võttis liikmesriik selleks, et tagada fondi toetusel rakendatud projektide tulemuste püsijäämine (nii kavandamise kui ka rakendamise etapis)?</p>
	<p>In order to ensure the functioning of the equipment and systems acquired and activated with the support of the Fund, the beneficiaries were asked to address the issue of sustainability already in the project planning phase. In the application form the beneficiaries are required to specify the size of the operating and follow-up costs and describe how these costs will be covered after the termination of the projects. Although generally the maintenance costs of the acquired equipment and IT systems are included in the state budget, their availability cannot be ensured for the whole expected service life of the devices as state budget is planned for one year only. Therefore, while planning the project it is not always possible for beneficiaries to guarantee the accessibility of state funds for covering maintenance costs in a longer period. As an example, discussion on Entry/Exit System was initiated already in 2011, but will be implemented not until 2021 – it is not conceivable to secure the availability of financial resources for its sustainment (especially if the amount needed is not known).</p>

7.2	Kas kavandamise ja rakendamise etapis kasutati mehhanisme jätkusuutlikkuse kontrolli tagamiseks?
	No specific mechanisms were put in place at the programming phase to ensure a sustainability check. The programme was designed with the knowledge that only the most substantial actions will be financed and therefore the sustainability of the results is of high priority. However, as the state budget is planned on a yearly basis, the availability of national funds cannot be ensured for the whole expected lifetime of the results at the programming phase. The main mechanism to ensure a sustainability check at implementation phase is described in chapter 7.1.

7.3	Kui suurel määral oodatakse fondi toel saadud tulemuste/kasu jätkumist pärast toetuse lõppemist?
	<p>Based on the feedback from beneficiaries and information provided in the projects' and programme reports it can be concluded that all the equipment acquired and upgraded so far with support of the Fund (e.g. computers, vehicles, small bomb robots) fulfil their main expected functions and are used by the target group (e.g. border guards, deminers, police officers) also after the completion of projects. The expected service life of different devices procured remains primarily between 3 to 15 years depending on a certain item and intensity of its use. However, currently it is not yet clear, whether and which financial resources will be available to address the needs that will still exist after the equipment purchased within the ISF has become depreciated. In one case, in order to avoid the need to replace devices in the future all at once, beneficiary implemented the procurement of technique in several phases. Such an approach helps to scatter investments in the equipment required in the future. With regard to the maintenance of equipment, it is expected that due to a higher efficiency and quality of the devices, they require less servicing (less malfunctions). This has already become evident in case of new vehicles for patrolling purchased with support of the ISF. Furthermore, in several cases easier repair works can be performed by beneficiary organisations themselves which all results in maintenance cost savings.</p> <p>The extent of sustainability of the positive effects of the information systems elaborated within the actions supported by the Fund depends largely on future development needs. Today the completed systems perform their tasks as planned and their maintenance costs are covered by the state budget. Nevertheless, due to the unpredictability of external (e.g. new requirements and regulations set for the systems on EU level) or internal (e.g. feedback from their end users on the system functionality) development demand it might be more difficult to ensure necessary financial resources for keeping the IT systems at a level that matches future expectations and requirements. This is especially true in the case of IT solutions that contribute to the implementation of different obligatory agreements at EU level (e.g. ETIAS, Entry/Exit, Passenger Name Record) – as the size of maintenance cost of such systems is currently unknown it is complicated to reserve funds for their operating and further development. For the purpose of guaranteeing the continuity of the services provided by the IT systems</p>

	<p>developed with support of the ISF, it is essential to secure basic funding for each service.</p> <p>Forecasting the continuity of the results achieved with trainings for different target groups (e.g. police officials, consular and tax officers) is rather challenging. One of the preconditions for the sustainability of the effects is the utility of trainings. On the basis of different information sources it can be said that in majority the trainings carried out to date within the national programme for ISF have proven beneficial for the participants – the knowledge and skills gained within trainings are of practical value and help to better perform their daily tasks. As an example, in the field of visa policy, the trainings have been highly appreciated by consular officials. Although certain requirements might change in the future, the working procedures remain to a large extent unchanged and therefore the new skills acquired will still be relevant (and passed on to new colleagues). All in all, as most of the beneficiaries do not see fluctuation of personnel as a significant issue in their organisation (takes place commonly within the organisation itself), the potential for the sustainability of the trainings' effects can be considered rather positive.</p> <p>A distinctive example of sustainability of the results of the ISF actions include the information and learning materials developed within the project which focused on combating crime through the prevention of trafficking of human beings. The project's communication materials have already been applied as part of lectures given in schools in order to raise awareness about human trafficking. The materials are also available online and can be used by different target groups (e.g. NGOs) for communication activities.</p>
--	---

7.4	Missuguseid meetmeid võeti, et tagada tänu tegevustoetusele võetud meetmete järjepidevus?
	As Estonia is not using the operating support within the ISF, the evaluation question is not applicable.

8	Lihtsustamine ja halduskoormuse vähendamine
---	---

8	Üldine küsimus: Kas lihtsustati fondi juhtimismenetlusi ja vähendati toetusesaajate halduskoormust?
	In overall, the establishment of the ISF structure has not led to an extensive reduction in the administrative burden compared to the SOLID Fund. Nevertheless, the ISF involves a number of advantages, which have to a certain

	<p>extent simplified programme implementation both from the Member State and beneficiary perspective. For instance, switching from an annual to a multi-annual structure of the national programme has been beneficial for the Responsible Authority (RA) in reducing its programme management related duties as compiling programme documents annually is no longer expected by the Commission. The multi-annual programme of the ISF allows also a higher degree of flexibility in planning the programme actions and their budgets; however, even more flexibility is anticipated by the RA so that the needs which become more specific during the implementation phase could be met. This is essential in order to avoid the necessity to adopt changes in the programme, which is a time-consuming procedure requiring a government-level intervention. Increase in the number of programme indicators has proved to be unfavourable from the perspective of administrative burden. Also, the content of indicators is not always unambiguous which might cause different interpretations between Member States.</p> <p>The main focus for the RA has been on seeking possibilities to simplify the project management related procedures in order to reduce the administrative burden for the programme beneficiaries. Although the eligibility rules have to a large extent remained the same, certain amendments (e.g. making fringe-benefit tax eligible) have proved to be beneficial for beneficiaries. On the downside, the rules complicate reimbursement of labour costs in case of overtime, which unfortunately is rather common for project managers who often perform their project related tasks outside office hours. Altogether, the administrative burden is not considered unreasonable, although at certain times (e.g. during reporting period) fulfilling project management tasks require a lot of effort. Beneficiaries who have also been involved in the implementation of projects financed by the External Borders Fund do not see remarkable differences when it comes to the administrative burden. However, within the ISF programme it is easier to apply smaller changes (e.g. deadline extension) making the fund more flexible compared to the SOLID funds.</p>
--	---

8.1	<p>Kas fondi poolt kasutusele võetud uuenduslikud menetlused (lihtsustatud kuluvõimalus, mitmeaastane tegevuskava, riiklikud rahastamiskõlblikkuse nõuded, terviklikumad riiklikud programmid, mis võimaldavad paindlikkust, tegevustoetus ja transiidi eriskeem Leedu jaoks) on lihtsustanud ka fondist toetusesaajate tööd?</p>
	<p>The national eligibility rules were developed by the RA following the rules of the previous period and in addition, compliance with the eligibility rules of the European Structural and Investments Funds was also sought. One of the changes applied concerned the fringe-benefit tax, which was made eligible exceptionally in Estonia. This was highly appreciated by one of the beneficiary organisations as well as it has enabled to improve the overall quality of the trainings undertaken (e.g. include catering service). Main criticism in terms of the rules concerns the eligibility of labour costs. According to the rules these are reimbursed only when the tasks performed within the project are not included in the regular job description of the project personnel. This has in several cases</p>

resulted in a situation where project managers who frequently perform the role outside regular working hours, cannot be paid as their routine tasks overlap with projects tasks. In addition, reporting about the working hours has become to some degree more extensive – although overview about the content of the tasks is not required monthly, their description has to be more detailed compared to what was expected within the External Borders Fund. Therefore various project managers have brought out the need to make the rules more flexible when it comes to labour costs.

Regarding the reporting procedures, the interim and final report forms were simplified by the RA and beneficiaries are no longer obliged to submit reports in every 6 months, but with a longer interval. As an example, if the project's duration is less than a year, there is no need to fill out an interim report. The general perception among the beneficiaries is that the work load related to reporting activities is not overwhelming. Although it sometimes involves a certain degree of bureaucracy, reporting is seen inevitable. The structure of the reports has been understandable and it is deemed very valuable that in numerous cases the Responsible Authority has already partially pre-filled the interim reports (e.g. information on indicators). Another positive aspect highlighted by the beneficiaries concerns the fact that submitting reports in paper format is no longer required.

The burden related to collecting project-related financial information, on the other hand, has risen compared to the implementation period of the SOLID funds. This, however, is not due to the ISF requirements but derives from the national arrangements of public sector accounting. Previously it was possible to conduct financial procedures (e.g. invoice processing and payment) within the beneficiary organisation, but today, as the public sector accounting has been centralised, making of the financial audit trail has proved to be rather challenging and time-consuming (information has to be collected from different sources). This is especially true for beneficiary organisations, which are not under the jurisdiction of the Ministry of the Interior (the RA does not have access to their accounting documents and records. On a positive side, in case of more experienced beneficiaries the revision of expense receipts is performed on the basis of samples only (not all receipts are checked). Also the indirect costs are not reviewed by the RA and can be declared as a single sum by the beneficiaries. Still, the related documentation has to be correct in case a project is subject to on-the-spot checks.

All in all, beneficiaries do not see administration related duties as an obstacle in implementing the projects. The burden is higher at certain periods (e.g. during the initial phase and reporting), when project managers are often supported by colleagues in the organisation (e.g. accountants). Several beneficiaries have also stressed the importance of the operative and useful assistance provided by the Responsible Authority in case of questions and problems.

Kolme „eduloo“ kirjeldus kõikide rahastatud projektide seast

### Näide 1

#### **Project “Narcotics Tester” (EE/2015/PR/0017)**

The main focus of the project implemented in cooperation of the Police and Border Guard Board (PBGB) and Tallinn University of Technology (TTÜ) was to find out whether it is possible to develop a reliable and accurate drug tester for detecting drug intoxication from saliva. Different narcotics analysers used today often produce false results and expert analysis of samples (e.g. in laboratories) is commonly time-consuming entailing complex and expensive procedures, and requiring specific skills. Therefore, it was decided to explore the opportunity to elaborate a tester, which would be able to produce quickly reliable and evidential results based on on-site measurements (including outdoors).

The main development activities of the project involved the analysis of scientific literature on the determination of 5 major narcotic drugs (cannabinoids, amphetamines, cocaine, fentanyl, GHB) in saliva samples, development of the pre-treatment methodology for saliva samples by using the capillary electrophoresis (CE) method, development of portative device, validation of methods and analysis of real samples.

Although the results of research conducted within the project are preliminary, the laboratory experiments and construction of a drug tester prototype can be considered successful. Tests with simulated as well as real samples (Police analysed saliva samples of 8 persons suspected of having drug intoxication) allow to conclude that the technology of capillary electrophoresis accompanied with the fluorescence and detection of conductivity of the substances analysed, is able to detect narcotic drugs (amphetamines, cannabinoids, cocaine, fentanyl and GHB) in human saliva at concentrations, which are in many cases lower than the regulations of different states require. The technology also enables to construct portative devices that are suitable for use on the spot, where the users of narcotic drugs need to be detected (i.e. the device is portable). The main advantages of the CE methodology include short analysis time (the procedure of saliva sample collection, clean-up and analysis takes approximately 15 minutes), economical use of reagents, minimum sample requirements and it can easily be miniaturized. Moreover, for drug abuse control, saliva is available at any time and sample can be collected in public view to prevent adulteration or sample substitution. In addition, saliva sample collection does not require any special training.

As a result of the project, a new, resource-efficient and unique (currently no device of such methodology and sensitivity is available in the world) fluorescence detector was elaborated. Although the prototype has already been used in real life situations (random testing of people in Weekend Festival Baltic in 2016 and 2017), it still has room for improvement. Therefore, within the ISF-funded follow-up project (application to be submitted in August 2017) it is planned to further develop the device (e.g. reduce the size; increase the user-friendliness of the software) in cooperation with TTÜ. It is expected that in the next two years (depending on the updating of the related legislation in Estonia), the results produced by the device can be used as an evidence in court proceedings and thereby contribute to preventing and combating crime (especially drug trafficking), which is one the programme’s objectives.

## Näide 1

The project has also acquired international attention as it has been introduced in the "18th International Symposium on Advances in Extraction Technologies & 22nd International Symposium On Separation Sciences", where the related poster presentation was awarded first prize.

One of the main lessons learned within the project was that the bold decision to invest resources in scientific research instead of acquiring existing options for solving bottlenecks can lead to rewarding results. The science-based approach (collaboration with university) used in the project proved to be justified and created prerequisites for further improvement in the field. Another factor that contributed to the success of the project was the productive cooperation with the project partner (TTÜ) – signing of partnership agreement was a beneficial approach and will be used also in the follow-up project.

## Näide 2

### **Project “Small Bomb Disposal Robots” (EE/2015/PR/0015)**

At the time of programming, small bomb disposal robots used by the Estonian Rescue Board had become depreciated causing a certain gap in the capability of elimination of bomb and explosion threat. In order to better ensure the safety of residents and rescue workers, and reliability of vital services, it was decided to acquire new bomb disposal robots.

Within the project five bomb robots were purchased according to the plan and distributed between four regional bomb groups. One of the robots was handed over to the CBRN experts in the Explosive Ordinance Disposal Centre for performing works in contaminated areas in case of CBRN incidents. However, the project budget had to be increased due to an unforeseen and rather significant rise in the price of the bomb disposal robots to be procured. An efficient solution to the problem was covering the deficit by using own funds and the remaining resources from the project “Heavy Bomb Suits”. Although the unexpected price increase did not affect negatively the overall implementation of the project activities (the project goal was achieved), it brought out a common risk accompanying such project-based approach – cost uncertainty due to the long-time interval between the planning and the actual implementation. The budget of the project “Small Bomb Disposal Robots” was especially vulnerable as there are not many producers of bomb robots (specific technique) and the globalized terrorism threat caused major changes in the global market.

The robots, which have already been used in solving more than 20 incidents, are especially crucial in neutralizing or removing explosive devices from locations that are narrow or hard to access. In addition, these can be used in organising observation of the incident location in case of an armed crime or other dangerous situations. Although the information received might be more limited compared to what could be observed by a rescue worker (cameras do not detect everything), it is of high value in making the right decisions for solving the critical situations in the most reasonable and safe way. Moreover, replacing human resources where possible, the bomb robots help to ensure the protection of life and health of rescue workers. So far, the feedback from the users of the bomb robots has been very positive.

## Näide 2

As a result of the project, not only the capacity of protecting critical infrastructure against security-related incidents has enhanced, but ensuring the protection of people's everyday life in a broader sense has reached a new level. A wider impact can also be detected at EU level as representatives of several countries have visited the Ministry of Interior in Estonia to get acquainted with the project and the benefits of the bomb robots. The successful implementation of the project has strengthened their confidence in the equipment itself, but also in the feasibility of such projects. In addition, the project has contributed to a better preparation of the rescue workers as the bomb robots can be used during their trainings without jeopardizing the capacity to react to real life incidents.

A lesson learned during the project was that a substantial success factor in achieving the goal is to have a good cooperation with a contractor which in this case proved to be very useful (good price and quality ratio). Another lesson learned was that such projects can be beneficial in finding new cooperation partners both at national and international level and thereby increase the credibility of the organisation. The network of contacts established during the project will likely form a basis for further developments in the future.

## Näide 3

### **Project “New Police Mobile Workstation Development” (EE/2015/PR/0012) and project “New Police Mobile Workstation Development (2nd phase)” (EE/2015/PR/0032; EE/2015/PR/0034)**

The computer systems in police cars had been in use for more than 10 years and become outdated. The systems were no longer sufficiently reliable and sometimes caused delays in responding to the incidents (e.g. due to a slowdown of information requests). As a result, it was more difficult to perform necessary duties. In order to improve the capability of police officials and border guards it was considered important to replace the depreciated e-police equipment and finance related ICT development.

The projects were implemented according to the initial plan and objectives have been achieved. Within the first project (1st phase) 2 software modules were developed and 10 prototypes of e-police hardware purchased and installed into police cars. As a result of the second project (2nd phase), the new e-police solution is ready to use altogether in 212 cars, including 62 new border guard vehicles, which procurement was financed by the ISF as well.

The new user-friendly and reliable ICT solution developed within the projects substantially improves information exchange in outdoor conditions. The new system enables making on-line inquiries from a car to different databases and thereby provides police officials and border guards with relevant and prompt information. That in turn enhances the capacity to react to potential irregular migration and/or different types of crime incidents. As the system is flexible and equipped with a function, which allows to give immediate feedback, it is possible to swiftly improve the quality of the system according to the needs of its actual users (e.g. add new or further develop existing functions). Another positive aspect of the e-police solution is its intuition-based use – the system does not have a user manual and no trainings have been carried out for its users (appr. 1500 users today). However, if necessary, it is possible to practice in the testing environment of the system. The feedback received so

### Näide 3

far from the users has been positive in majority – better availability of information and user-friendliness of the system allows to perform the duties of the police officials and border guards in a more efficient and effective manner.

On a wider scale, the projects have mainly created preconditions for more effective crime prevention and border management, which are the objectives of the national programme. But in addition, the developed ICT solution contributes also to the area of traffic by helping to secure safety on the streets. Moreover, some of the functionalities of the system have already proven to be useful in reducing the threat of terrorism which is currently at a higher level in Estonia due to the obligations and events related to the Estonian Presidency (e.g. the system enables to monitor the routes of delegations escorts).

All in all, the decision to develop and introduce the new e-police system in several phases (altogether in the framework of three different projects) proved to be justified as the needs and opportunities in the area of ICT change rather quickly. The success of the projects was also supported by the application of agile and flexible development methodology, which was taken into use by the beneficiary organisation during the implementation of the first project. According to the approach the information system is completed piece by piece and each finished component can be promptly tested and used by the client. As a result, it was possible to fasten the process and improve the system in compliance with the feedback received from the end-user. Another success factor of the projects was a good cooperation with the contractors (both software and hardware). As the procurement followed exceptional procedures (due to the sensitive information related to the projects), it was possible to choose enterprises who had successfully passed the background check. Moreover, a 5-year framework contract enabled to perform the work in a flexible way and gave confidence to both parties.

## Näide

### **Project “Procurement of Watercraft and Vehicles for Watercraft Transportation” (EE/2016/PR/0041)**

The projects implemented so far within the Estonian national ISF programme have or will likely achieve their expected results at reasonable cost and contribute to the national programme. Therefore, at the time of interim evaluation, no ISF project can be considered unsuccessful in terms of its effectiveness or efficiency. The project described below has faced several difficulties, but cannot be defined as a failure.

As in case of land vehicles, the majority of watercrafts used by the PBGB had been procured with the support of Schengen Facility (in 2004-2007) and had exceeded their planned life span. The old motorboats and scooters were not sufficiently fast and due their depreciation it was not always possible to react to border or rescue incidents under more difficult weather conditions (e.g. in case of high waves). Furthermore, due to the aging technique of old watercrafts (e.g. engine failures) the safety of border guards in performing their duties could not be always ensured. Therefore, it was necessary to replace old watercrafts with new, modern and more dependable vessels.

The project is ongoing, but the majority of the watercrafts (motorboats and scooters) have been procured, delivered to necessary locations and currently in use by the border guard. The construction of the biggest motorboats is expected to be completed by the end of March 2018. The implementation of the project has also faced certain obstacles, which have primarily derived from procurements. The acquisition of hydrocopters has proved to be notably problematic – two procurements have already failed and the third one is to be announced in autumn 2017. The failure of procurements, however, has been caused by external factors and could not have been avoided by the beneficiary organisation. One of the factors likely to affect the achievement of the overall objective of the project is withdrawal from purchasing vehicles for watercraft transportation. As the actual cost of those vehicles and motorboats (type M3) exceeded the planned costs, it was decided to acquire only the motorboats. As a result, watercraft transportation service has to be outsourced which affects the efficiency of watercraft maintenance as the waiting list for the service can be 1 to 2 weeks. That in turn affects to a certain extent the readiness to respond to border incidents.

The watercrafts acquired enhance the effectiveness of patrolling activities and operational response to different state border surveillance related incidents or identification of floating structures at sea and transboundary waters. One of the main advantages of the new watercrafts is their improved resistance to challenging weather conditions. Furthermore, watercrafts, which will be equipped with night vision and thermal cameras, contribute also to a better capability of performing search and rescue operations.

One of the lessons learned concerns the resource planning. Although the potential need for human and time resources was consulted, a more careful planning would have been beneficial for the implementation of such a comprehensive project. As the project runs for almost three years and involves several procurements, the size of the project team and the number of the working hours foreseen has not been in line with the amount of project tasks.

**Näide**

Another lesson is related to the trainings – it would have been more reasonable not to include only the training of instructors as part of the project, but also all the users of the watercrafts.

The objective of the interim evaluation was to assess the progress made in implementing the Estonian national ISF programme and the results achieved at mid-term of the 2014-2020 programming period. The evaluation focused on answering the evaluation questions on effectiveness, efficiency, relevance, coherence, complementarity, EU added value, sustainability, as well as simplification and reduction of administrative burden. Based on the nature of the questions, the evaluation took predominantly a qualitative approach, combined with some quantitative elements in the analysis of effectiveness (data on programme and project indicators) and efficiency (budget-related information on programme and project level).

The evaluation was based on two types of data collection methods: document analysis and interviews with stakeholders. The desk study formed an important part of the evaluation, which on one hand gave necessary background information to understand the legislative, political and strategic context in which the programme is implemented and the needs related to the supported fields. On the other hand, it facilitated to identify the extent of data available for answering the evaluation questions. Desk research was primarily carried out on the basis of documents made available to the evaluators by the Ministry of the Interior (MoI) (e.g. Estonian National Programme for ISF, programme implementation reports, programme accounts and project documentation – grant agreements and reports) and documents with public access, including national strategic documents (e.g. Internal Security Strategy for 2015-2020) and relevant Regulations of the European Parliament and of the Council (No 513/2014, No 514/2014 and No 515/2014). These strategic documents provided an essential basis on which the relevance, coherence, complementarity and effectiveness of the ISF-funded actions were evaluated. Information in the grant agreements and project reports gave a detailed overview of the expected and achieved results on project level, the challenges met and changes made in the initial plans during the course of the projects. This analysis was complemented with a study of the implementation reports of the programme (2015 and 2016) submitted to the European Commission by the Responsible Authority, which provided an overview of the programme's results compared to the targets set in the programme document.

The findings of the desk study served as a source of further questions which needed to be specified and discussed in more detail, and thus provided an essential input for preparing and conducting the interviews. Altogether 13 interviews were carried out with 20 stakeholders – 5 semi-structured interviews with the representatives of the MoI and project managers/coordinators, 1 group interview with policy makers of the MoI and 7 telephone interviews with project managers. Interviews with the project managers and coordinators of 5 beneficiary organisations (Police and Border Guard Board, Ministry of Justice, Rescue Board, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, and IT and Development Centre of the MoI) involved a discussion of the results of the projects, factors that affected the results and other issues relevant to the evaluation questions posed in the evaluation report. The main focus of the group interview with policy makers was on the relevance of the programme – whether the objectives set in the programme are still relevant and in line with current needs and problems in the supported fields.

Collection of data to formulate indicators was the responsibility of the evaluator and it took place in cooperation with the representatives of the Ministry of the Interior. Information on

certain indicators was asked from the beneficiary organisations and officials related to the specific field.

At the final stage of the evaluation, data and information collected from the document analysis and interviews were analysed and synthesized in order to provide answers to each evaluation question. Triangulation of different sources of information and data was used to verify the information received and ensure the maximum possible reliability of the findings. In summary, the data and information collected from written materials and through interviews proved sufficient to answer the evaluation questions and develop conclusions on progress made in implementing the Estonian national ISF programme and the results achieved to date.

**Main conclusions**

**Järeldus 1**

According to the national eligibility rules, the labour costs of the project personnel are eligible (and thereby reimbursed) only if the tasks performed within the project are not part of the regular job description of the project personnel. However, as the job descriptions of the officials working in the beneficiary organisations are often broad-based containing rather comprehensive definitions of tasks to be performed, the project-related duties often overlap with those set in the job descriptions. Hence, there have been numerous cases where project managers who frequently execute their project-related obligations outside regular working hours, cannot be compensated for their work they have already done for the project. This has led to lower motivation of project managers, which in turn might affect the overall implementation of the projects financed by the Fund.

**Järeldus 2**

The number of programme indicators is rather considerable and collecting relevant information has therefore proved to be rather unfavourable from the perspective of administrative burden. Moreover, the content of indicators is not always unambiguous which might cause different interpretations between Member States. That in turn might lead to inaccurate conclusions about the effectiveness of the programme. Also the instructions on filling in the information about the indicators are not sufficient.

**Järeldus 3**

In the case of IT solutions that contribute to the implementation of different obligatory agreements at EU level (e.g. ETIAS, Passenger Name Record), the size of the maintenance cost of such systems is unknown. Therefore, it is complicated to reserve funds for their operating and further development at national level. Due to the unpredictability of external (e.g. new requirements set for the systems at EU level) or internal (e.g. feedback from their end users on the system functionality) development demand it might be more difficult to ensure necessary financial resources for keeping these IT systems at a level that matches future expectations and requirements.

**Järeldus 4**

**Järeldus 5**

## Recommendations

### Soovitused 1

It is recommended to adapt the national eligibility rules in a manner that would contribute to eliminating situations where labour costs of the project personnel cannot be reimbursed due to the overlap between the project-related duties and tasks defined in the regular job description of the personnel in the beneficiary organisation. When relevant, the beneficiary organisations could be advised to specify the job descriptions of the project personnel in a way that the overlap between the tasks is avoided.

### Soovitused 2

Collecting information on the impact indicators within the interim evaluation is not reasonable as the implementation of the programme is ongoing and the impact of its actions has not likely occurred. It is also highly recommended to provide more specific instructions on the content of the indicators.

### Soovitused 3

For the purpose of guaranteeing the sustainability of the services provided by the IT systems that contribute to the implementation of different obligatory agreements at EU level (e.g. ETIAS, Passenger Name Record) and developed with support of the ISF, it is recommended to provide also the maintenance costs of these systems to a reasonable extent at the EU level.

### Soovitused 4

### Soovitused 5

**Esitada hinnang vahehindamise kohta, mis tehti määruse (EL) nr 514/2014 artikli 15 kohaselt. Vajadusel teha kokkuvõtte olulisematest muudatustest, mis avaldavad mõju teie fondist kaetud poliitikavaldkondade tegevustele, ning sellest, kuidas teie riiklikku programmi on muudetud/muudetakse.**

According to the results of the mid-term review it can be said that the overall situation in the policy areas covered by the Fund has not significantly changed as compared to when the national programme for ISF was adopted. For today, the Estonian national programme has been amended once due to the need to fill the obligations of the PNR Directive (Directive 2016/681). At the time of the interim evaluation, the actions and objectives of the programme can still be considered relevant and address the actual needs identified at national level. Still, recent developments in the world demonstrate that new threats (e.g. terrorism) are emerging that have to be addressed even more carefully. For instance, in connection with the Estonian Presidency, the demand for the services of deminers has significantly increased (preparation of different summits). Also the prevention of radicalisation, which is not yet a significant threat in Estonia, requires more attention.

Although some new topics have emerged (e.g. increased terrorism threat, obligations related to introduce different information systems required at EU level) during the implementation phase of the programme, they mostly fall into the scope of the existing objectives and actions presented in the programme. Therefore, adjustment of the content of the national programme is not necessary at the moment. However, as concluded in the mid-term review, additional financial resources are required in order to improve the effectiveness in addressing the needs.

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministeerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

**ASUTUSESISESEKS KASUTAMISEKS**

**Märge tehtud 08.12.2017**

**Kehtib kuni 08.12.2022**

**Alus: AvTS § 35 lg 1 p 3, 9, 10**

**Teabevaldaja: Siseministerium**

Tabel 1. Finantsrakendamisel saavutatud edusammud konkreetsete eesmärkide kaupa (eurodes)

## Finantsaruanne ISF – piirid

Riiklik eesmärk / erimeede	A Kokku tasutud 1.1.2014– 15.10.2016	B Kokku tasutud 16.10.2016– 30.6.2017	Kokku tasutud {0} kavandatud (%)
ERIEESMÄRK1.RIIKLIK EESMÄRK1 Riigi suutlikkus	242 664,99	168 452,94	59,58%
ERIEESMÄRK1.RIIKLIK EESMÄRK2 Liidu acquis	66 457,07	13 575,65	71,14%
<b>RIIKLIK JA ERIEESMÄRK KOKKU1</b>	<b>309 122,06</b>	<b>182 028,59</b>	<b>61,20%</b>
<b>KOKKU ERIEESMÄRK1</b>	<b>309 122,06</b>	<b>182 028,59</b>	<b>61,20%</b>
ERIEESMÄRK2.RIIKLIK EESMÄRK1 EUROSUR	493 500,00	-162,86	9,67%
ERIEESMÄRK2.RIIKLIK EESMÄRK2 Teabevahetus	680 250,00	554 897,29	98,76%
ERIEESMÄRK2.RIIKLIK EESMÄRK3 Liidu ühised normid	38 250,00	186 750,00	42,86%
ERIEESMÄRK2.RIIKLIK EESMÄRK4 Liidu acquis	115 056,38	-7 479,38	20,79%
ERIEESMÄRK2.RIIKLIK EESMÄRK6 Riigi suutlikkus	9 281 573,37	1 490 575,70	89,81%
<b>RIIKLIK JA ERIEESMÄRK KOKKU2</b>	<b>10 608 629,75</b>	<b>2 224 580,75</b>	
<b>KOKKU ERIEESMÄRK2</b>	<b>10 608 629,75</b>	<b>2 224 580,75</b>	<b>66,18%</b>
<b>RIIKLIK JA ERIEESMÄRK KOKKU3</b>			
<b>KOKKU ERIEESMÄRK3</b>			
Technical Assistance	47 539,77	48 368,12	
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>10 965 291,58</b>	<b>2 454 977,46</b>	<b>61,61%</b>

**Finantsaruanne ISF – politsei**

<b>Riiklik eesmärk / erimeede</b>	<b>A Kokku tasutud 1.1.2014– 15.10.2016</b>	<b>B Kokku tasutud 16.10.2016– 30.6.2017</b>	<b>Kokku tasutud {0} kavandatud (%)</b>
ERIEESMÄRK5.RIIKLIK EESMÄRK1 Kuritegevus – kuritegevuse tõkestamine ja selle vastu võitlemine	4 703 382,72	1 200 233,73	87,17%
ERIEESMÄRK5.RIIKLIK EESMÄRK2 Kuritegevus – teabevahetus	201 000,00	791 353,90	157,24%
ERIEESMÄRK5.RIIKLIK EESMÄRK3 Kuritegevus – koolitus	476 160,75	15 242,63	107,41%
ERIEESMÄRK5.RIIKLIK EESMÄRK4 Kuritegevus – ohvrite abistamine	31 875,00	31 875,00	100,00%
<b>RIIKLIK JA ERIEESMÄRK KOKKU5</b>	<b>5 412 418,47</b>	<b>2 038 705,26</b>	
<b>KOKKU ERIEESMÄRK5</b>	<b>5 412 418,47</b>	<b>2 038 705,26</b>	<b>94,02%</b>
ERIEESMÄRK6.RIIKLIK EESMÄRK1 Riskid – riskide ennetamine ja nende kõrvaldamine	632 250,00	43 875,30	82,71%
ERIEESMÄRK6.RIIKLIK EESMÄRK3 Riskid – koolitus	75 000,00	37 500,00	60,00%
ERIEESMÄRK6.RIIKLIK EESMÄRK6 Riskid – varajane hoiatamine ja kriisolukorrad	273 675,00	429 331,58	71,48%
ERIEESMÄRK6.RIIKLIK EESMÄRK7 Riskid – ohu- ja riskihinnangud	157 500,00	157 500,00	100,00%
<b>RIIKLIK JA ERIEESMÄRK KOKKU6</b>	<b>1 138 425,00</b>	<b>668 206,88</b>	
<b>KOKKU ERIEESMÄRK6</b>	<b>1 138 425,00</b>	<b>668 206,88</b>	<b>38,59%</b>
Technical Assistance	59 411,01	41 023,05	
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>6 610 254,48</b>	<b>2 747 935,19</b>	<b>69,42%</b>

**Tabel 2. Projektide arv ja ELi toetus lõpetatud ja avatud projektidele konkreetsete eesmärkide kaupa (eurodes)**

	<b>Projektide arv ja ELi toetus</b>			
	<b>1.1.2014–15.10.2016</b>			
	<b>Lõpetatud projektide arv kokku</b>	<b>ELi toetus kokku lõpetatud projektidele</b>	<b>Avatud projektide arv kokku</b>	<b>ELi toetus kokku avatud projektidele</b>
Erieesmärk1 - Toetus ühisele viisapoliitikale	3	66 902,76	3	242 219,30
Erieesmärk2 - Piirid	2	14 081,27	16	10 594 548,48
Erieesmärk3 - Tegevustoetus	0	0,00	0	0,00
Erieesmärk4 - Tehniline abi – viisa ja piirid	0	0,00	0	0,00
Erieesmärk5 - Kuritegevuse tõkestamine ja selle vastu võitlemine	2	168 836,40	13	5 243 582,07
Erieesmärk6 - Riskid ja kriisiolukorrad	2	540 000,00	8	598 425,00
Erieesmärk7 - Tehniline abi – politsei	0	0,00	0	0,00
Erieesmärk8 - Erijuht: Tegevustoetus transiidi eriskeemile (Leedu)	0	0,00	0	0,00
<b>Kokku 1</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>789 820,43</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>16 678 774,85</b>

	<b>Projektide arv ja ELi toetus</b>			
	<b>16.10.2016–30.6.2017</b>			
	<b>Lõpetatud projektide arv kokku</b>	<b>ELi toetus kokku lõpetatud projektidele</b>	<b>Avatud projektide arv kokku</b>	<b>ELi toetus kokku avatud projektidele</b>
Erieesmärk1 - Toetus ühisele viisapoliitikale	2	-18 651,56	2	200 680,15
Erieesmärk2 - Piirid	7	-57 162,10	12	2 281 742,87
Erieesmärk3 - Tegevustoetus	0	0,00	0	0,00
Erieesmärk4 - Tehniline abi – viisa ja piirid	0	0,00	0	0,00

	<b>Projektide arv ja ELi toetus</b> <b>16.10.2016–30.6.2017</b>			
	<b>Lõpetatud projektide arv kokku</b>	<b>ELi toetus kokku lõpetatud projektidele</b>	<b>Avatud projektide arv kokku</b>	<b>ELi toetus kokku avatud projektidele</b>
Erieesmärk5 - Kuritegevuse tõkestamine ja selle vastu võitlemine	5	-10 006,81	11	2 048 712,07
Erieesmärk6 - Riskid ja kriisiolukorrad	2	-1 136,62	8	2 095 917,30
Erieesmärk7 - Tehniline abi – politsei	0	0,00	0	0,00
Erieesmärk8 - Erijuht: Tegevustoetus transiidi eriskeemile (Leedu)	0	0,00	0	0,00
<b>Kokku 2</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>-86 957,09</b>	<b>33</b>	<b>6 627 052,39</b>
<b>Kokku 1+2</b>	<b>25</b>	<b>702 863,34</b>	<b>73</b>	<b>23 305 827,24</b>

**Tabel 3. Projektide arv ja ELi toetus kasusaajate tüübi ja konkreetsete eesmärkide kaupa (eurodes)**

		Projekti kasusaajad 1.1.2014–15.10.2016			
		SO1: Visa policy	SO2: Borders	SO5: Crime	SO6: Risks & crisis
Riigi/föderaalsed ametiasutused	Projektide arv	6	18	15	10
Riigi/föderaalsed ametiasutused	ELi toetus	309 122,06	10 608 629,75	5 412 418,47	1 138 425,00
Kohalikud avalik-õiguslikud asutused	Projektide arv	0	0	0	0
Kohalikud avalik-õiguslikud asutused	ELi toetus	0,00	0,00	0,00	0,00
Valitsusvälised organisatsioonid	Projektide arv	0	0	0	0
Valitsusvälised organisatsioonid	ELi toetus	0,00	0,00	0,00	0,00
Rahvusvahelised avalik-õiguslikud organisatsioonid	Projektide arv	0	0	0	0
Rahvusvahelised avalik-õiguslikud organisatsioonid	ELi toetus	0,00	0,00	0,00	0,00
Riigi Punane Rist	Projektide arv	0	0	0	0
Riigi Punane Rist	ELi toetus	0,00	0,00	0,00	0,00
Rahvusvaheline Punase Risti Komitee	Projektide arv	0	0	0	0
Rahvusvaheline Punase Risti Komitee	ELi toetus	0,00	0,00	0,00	0,00
Rahvusvaheline Punase Risti ja Punase Poolkuu Seltside Föderatsioon	Projektide arv	0	0	0	0
Rahvusvaheline Punase Risti ja Punase Poolkuu Seltside Föderatsioon	ELi toetus	0,00	0,00	0,00	0,00
Avalik-õiguslikud ja eraettevõtted	Projektide arv	0	0	0	0
Avalik-õiguslikud ja eraettevõtted	ELi toetus	0,00	0,00	0,00	0,00
Haridus- ja teadusasutused	Projektide arv	0	0	0	0
Haridus- ja teadusasutused	ELi toetus	0,00	0,00	0,00	0,00

		Projekti kasusaajad 16.10.2016–30.6.2017			
		SO1: Visa policy	SO2: Borders	SO5: Crime	SO6: Risks & crisis
Riigi/föderaalsed ametiasutused	Projektide arv	4	19	16	10
Riigi/föderaalsed ametiasutused	ELi toetus	182 028,59	2 224 580,76	2 094 780,70	0,00
Kohalikud avalik-õiguslikud asutused	Projektide arv	0	0	0	0
Kohalikud avalik-õiguslikud asutused	ELi toetus	0,00	0,00	0,00	0,00
Valitsusvälised organisatsioonid	Projektide arv	0	0	0	0
Valitsusvälised organisatsioonid	ELi toetus	0,00	0,00	0,00	0,00
Rahvusvahelised avalik-õiguslikud organisatsioonid	Projektide arv	0	0	0	0
Rahvusvahelised avalik-õiguslikud organisatsioonid	ELi toetus	0,00	0,00	0,00	0,00
Riigi Punane Rist	Projektide arv	0	0	0	0
Riigi Punane Rist	ELi toetus	0,00	0,00	0,00	0,00
Rahvusvaheline Punase Risti Komitee	Projektide arv	0	0	0	0
Rahvusvaheline Punase Risti Komitee	ELi toetus	0,00	0,00	0,00	0,00
Rahvusvaheline Punase Risti ja Punase Poolkuu Seltside Föderatsioon	Projektide arv	0	0	0	0
Rahvusvaheline Punase Risti ja Punase Poolkuu Seltside Föderatsioon	ELi toetus	0,00	0,00	0,00	0,00
Avalik-õiguslikud ja eraettevõtted	Projektide arv	0	0	0	0
Avalik-õiguslikud ja eraettevõtted	ELi toetus	0,00	0,00	0,00	0,00
Haridus- ja teadusasutused	Projektide arv	0	0	0	0
Haridus- ja teadusasutused	ELi toetus	0,00	0,00	0,00	0,00

## Dokumendid

Dokumendi pealkiri	Dokumendi liik	Dokumendi kuupäev	Kohalik viide	Komisjoni viide	Failid	Saatmiskuupäev	Saatja
--------------------	----------------	-------------------	---------------	-----------------	--------	----------------	--------

**Latest validation results**

<b>Severity</b>	<b>Code</b>	<b>Message</b>
Teave		Hindamisaruande versioon on kinnitatud.